

“BLACK SOUNDS”: HEMINGWAY AND DUENDE

by

KRISTINE A. WILSON

Presented to the Faculty of the Graduate School of
The University of Texas at Arlington in Partial Fulfillment
of the Requirements
for the Degree of

MASTER OF ARTS IN ENGLISH

THE UNIVERSITY OF TEXAS AT ARLINGTON

August 2006

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This project was inspired by an undergraduate class on Hemingway and Faulkner; for his infectious enthusiasm, I gratefully acknowledge the illustrious Dr. Emory Estes.

My committee, particularly Dr. Laurin Porter, have provided invaluable guidance and limitless patience for which I am deeply indebted.

Dr. Carl Eby at the University of South Carolina at Beaufort has consistently and altruistically acted as my advocate and liaison with The Hemingway Society. His encouragement, suggestions, and support – especially during the planning stages – provided much-needed direction and helped to define the scope of the project.

Finally, without the support of my family, especially my mom and stepdad, graduate school might not have even been an option for me. For that, no words of gratitude can possibly suffice.

July 24, 2006

ABSTRACT

“BLACK SOUNDS”: HEMINGWAY AND DUENDE

Publication No. _____

Kristine A. Wilson, M.A.

The University of Texas at Arlington, 2006

Supervising Professor: Dr. Laurin Porter

Along with his efforts to revitalize the Spanish arts in the 1920's and 1930's, Spanish poet and playwright Federico García Lorca gave an address entitled “Play and Theory of Duende” in which he claims duende as a distinctly Spanish brand of artistic inspiration and performative signature bound up with the seemingly antithetical qualities of joy and suffering that dominate the Spanish ethos.

I argue that using Lorca's concept of duende as a tool for analyzing the Spanish-themed work of Ernest Hemingway provides a new way of situating Hemingway's work within the Spanish and modernist milieu. To this end, I perform readings of *The Sun Also Rises* and *For Whom the Bell Tolls* against analyses of the bullfight and *cante jondo*, the two Spanish arts Lorca claims are most evocative of (or susceptible to)

duende. Specifically, I focus on the aspects of liminality, primitivism, and performativity which are central both to Hemingway and these arts.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS.....	ii
ABSTRACT	iii
Chapter	
1. INTRODUCTION.....	1
1.1 Toward a Definition of Duende.....	2
1.2 Locating Duende within the Modernist Context	8
1.3 Hemingway and Spain: Review of Scholarship	10
1.4 Theory, Hemingway, Duende.....	14
2. HEMINGWAY AND THE “IN-BETWEEN”	18
2.1 Liminality, Marginality, and the “Unhomely”	18
2.2 The “In-Between” in <i>The Sun Also Rises</i>	21
2.3 A Nation Divided: Liminality in <i>For Whom the Bell Tolls</i>	30
3. HEMINGWAY AND PRIMITIVISM	37
3.1 Uses of the Primitive in <i>The Sun Also Rises</i>	41
3.2 Uses of the Primitive in <i>For Whom the Bell Tolls</i>	43
3.3 Hemingway’s “Ecstatic Prose”: Toward a Poetics of the Primitive.....	49
4. HEMINGWAY AND PERFORMANCE	51
4.1 Ritual Performance	54
4.2 Performer, Performance, and Audience.....	59

4.3 Performative Spaces and Socio-Cultural Performance.....	63
5. CONCLUSION	70
REFERENCES	74
BIOGRAPHICAL INFORMATION.....	78

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

The influence of Spain on Hemingway's aesthetic development and on his literary production cannot be overestimated and is indeed well-traveled territory in Hemingway criticism. My project, however, attempts to move away from previous studies that invest, I contend, too heavily in the biographical influence of Spain by suggesting a much deeper connection between the Spanish ethos and Hemingway's Spain-centered texts. This connection is best understood through Federico García Lorca's concept of *duende*. I will argue that the element of *duende* provides a crucial link in understanding Hemingway's literary relationship with Spain, one which could potentially provide new ways of reading Hemingway in conjunction with a variety of critical lenses.

My purpose here is not to question Lorca's potential influence on Hemingway and his work, but to offer Lorca's notion of *duende* as a way of rereading Hemingway both against the general modernist and more specific Spanish milieus. To this end, I will consider the way *duende* manifests in *cante jondo* and the bullfight, according to Lorca, and compare this to the way Hemingway uses similar techniques and tropes to the same end – that is, to get at what Spanish novelist Miguel Unamuno has called “the tragic sense of life,” which Hemingway regards as essential to truth, or verisimilitude. More specifically, I will consider liminality and border phenomena, primitivism, and

the performative as central and symbiotic characteristics of duende in the Spanish arts and in Hemingway.

1.1 Toward a Definition of Duende

In his essay “Play and Theory of Duende,” Lorca uses the duende figure from Spanish folklore metaphorically to outline an ambiguous artistic aesthetic that both derives from and produces the most profound type of artistic inspiration. Lorca writes of “the duende” alternately as a physical being and a metaphoric image, perhaps to emphasize that the nature of the duende defies a static definition. He describes it as enigmatic, a shape-shifter that often materializes in the presence of danger. Lorca claims the duende will only appear if death is possible, yet it is not an intrinsically negative force. The artist’s struggle with the duende – an internal struggle located “in the remotest mansions of the blood” – impels artistic production which transcends ordinary art, which comes from the soul and from the soul of the earth. It has cruel beauty.

In its folkloric sense, the duende is a demonic figure associated not necessarily with malevolence but with mischievousness, something akin to a poltergeist or a household sprite. In his essays and poetry, Lorca attempts to define and translate this demon into an abstract force that serves as both artistic inspiration and performative signature. The highly figurative, often playful language Lorca employs in his essays implies his amusement with the elusiveness of duende, “which could never be pinned down or rationalized away” (Hirsch 10). The vagueness of the concept is fitting, given

its mystical associations. Though not a religious tenet, it is comparable to voodoo in its incantatory power and its communion with the dark forces of nature and humanity, its celebration of life channeled through the recognition of death.¹ The idea of life springing from death is also associated with the cult of Mithras, in which the blood shed by the slaughtered bull fertilizes the land; this is the basis of the bullfighting ritual. Duende encompasses “the spirit of the earth, with visible anguish, irrational desire, demonic enthusiasm, and fascination with death” (Hirsch 10). In this way, duende is clearly aligned with the Dionysian spirit, with primitivism, and with folklore.

Lorca uses the bullfight and Andalusian folk music, which he calls “deep song,” to exemplify the qualities of duende for the purpose of its explication. Both have a performative and an emotional facet, and it is the particular way in which these are achieved (and, indeed, their fusion) that determines the artistic and emotional resonance of the experience and, therefore, its capacity for duende. Most significantly, duende is fundamentally internal, placing it apart from the inspiration or sustenance one might receive from an angel or muse. Lorca explains the difference:

The muse and angel come from outside us... but one must awaken the duende in the remotest mansions of the blood... the true fight is with the duende... he rejects all the sweet geometry we have learned, smashes styles, leans on human pain with no consolation (50-51).

¹ Lorca locates the roots of duende in the confluence of gypsy culture, which infiltrated Spain in the fifteenth century, and the Moorish culture that permeated the southern part of the Iberian peninsula for the preceding 800 years (711-1492 AD). Indeed, the connection between southern Spain and its mixed ethnic

It is by overcoming this internal struggle that we achieve “both contact with the depths and access to our higher selves” (Hirsch 10). This struggle, exemplified by every Hemingway protagonist, results in self-discovery and the rejection of illusion. It acknowledges death and the darker side of human nature and human experience, and embraces all of these as parts of life. As Hemingway wrote in a 1925 letter to his father, his goal when writing was “not just to depict life – or criticize it – but to actually make it alive... You can’t do this without putting in the bad and the ugly as well as what is beautiful” (*On Writing*, 33). The manifestation of duende in the bullfight, *cante jondo*, dance, and other forms allows the artist to bear witness to and ritualize the deepest anguish – and joy – of humanity. Through such ritual, the artist serves a metonymic function by which the private, singular experiences of the audience are made public and collective, thereby lessening the burden on the individual.²

Although Lorca acknowledges that duende is a borderless phenomenon (he finds it, for example, in the work of Paganini, Nietzsche, and Cezanne), he claims that it is felt particularly deeply within the souls of the Spanish people.³ This, he says, is due to

heritage aligns it in some ways more closely to Africa and Arabia than to Europe. Perhaps, then, the duende in Spain and Afro-Caribbean death cults such as voodoo are more than tangentially related.

² This is not dissimilar to the function of Christ in the Christian tradition, though duende is implicitly associated with a pre-Christian, pagan past. Insinuating the archetypal nature of ritual, Lorca compares the ritual of the bullfight to the Catholic Mass: “the liturgy of the bulls, an authentic religious drama where, as in Mass, a God is sacrificed to and adored” (“Play and Theory of Duende” 59).

³ Not incidentally, in *The Nick Adams Stories*, Hemingway specifically cites Cezanne as an artist whose technique Nick had admired and attempted to emulate in writing: “He wanted to write like Cezanne painted. Cezanne started with all the tricks. Then he broke the whole thing down and built the real thing.... You had to do it from inside yourself. There wasn’t any trick. Nobody had ever written...like that. He felt almost holy about it. It was deadly serious. You could do it if you would fight it out” (*On Writing*, 37). The idea of the creative struggle as a “fight” with an element of “deadly” seriousness and “holy” overtones strongly suggests a description of duende.

the status of death in Spain, the way its specter permeates all aspects of Spanish culture, including lullabies, folklore, music, and ritual:

Spain is moved by the duende, for it is a country of ancient music and dance where the duende squeezes the lemons of death – a country of death, open to death. Everywhere else, death is an end. Death comes, and they draw the curtains. Not in Spain. In Spain they open them. Many Spaniards live indoors until the day they die and are taken out into the sunlight. A dead man in Spain is more alive as a dead man than anyplace else in the world. (“Play and Theory” 55)

Explaining duende in the context of the Spanish tradition, which he claims are profoundly and indelibly bound to one another, Lorca claims that duende exists at its purest in the Spanish arts of the bullfight and *cante jondo* (deep song).

Purity, precision and emotional resonance are integral to the ritual of the bullfight, which figures strongly in all of Hemingway’s Spain-centered texts. The expression of duende in the bullfight presents a struggle between body and spirit, between intellect and emotion. This is also true of *cante jondo*; when overcome by the duende, the singer conveys the “tragic sense of life” not only in the words of the song but in its corporeal performance, in the timbre of voice, the expression of face, the movement or the stillness of limbs.⁴ In the bullfight, the *torero* must mitigate his fear and the anguish of the kill (of death), by achieving mastery of (e)motion. If duende is

⁴ This is also true of certain forms of flamenco. Such dance fluctuates between motion that is improvised, frenetic, and orgiastic and that which is slow, calculated, and tightly controlled. In this way, it reifies the internal struggle between the irrational and rational, the unconscious and the conscious, the Dionysian

to be found in the bullring, it is not in the flailing, melodramatic gestures of the *torero* who self-consciously plays to the crowd, but in the tightly controlled ritual dance of man and bull.

Further, both art forms are at once collective and solitary experiences. In his “Poem of the Bull,” Lorca explains that the *torero* “goes to the ring to be alone with the bull, an animal he both fears and adores, and to whom he has much to say” (84). The bullfight, then, in the presence of *duende*, can be read as a reification of the eternal struggle between the conscious and unconscious, between the man and his own animal nature. But paradoxically, the ritual of the bullfight is much more than the confrontation of man and beast; it incorporates the crowd as well, which is “composed not of spectators but of actors. Each person in the audience fights the bull along with the *torero*, not by following the flight of the cape, but by using another imaginary one that moves differently from the one in the ring” (Lorca 85). The *torero* thereby performs a metonymic function for the collective consciousness; he “bears the yearning of thousands of people, and the bull plays the leading role in a collective drama” (Lorca 85). Moreover, the role of the audience is not a peripheral one; its presence is required, both in the capacity of witness and participant, in order to ritualize the performance.

Cante jondo, or deep song, is another distinctly Spanish art form in which the performer serves as conduit for the pain and suffering of the Spanish people and of their ancestors. Its association with the confluence of Arabic, Moorish, Jewish, Indian and

and the Apollonian. The tension here, when well executed, has an affective quality that implicates the audience in the performance.

gypsy cultures in Andalucía invests it with diasporic significance, explained in more detail in the next chapter. *Cante jondo* has, in recent years, been integrated into the flamenco tradition, though Lorca would quarrel with this; he considers flamenco a cheap imitation of true deep song. From a contemporary perspective, there is an apparent implication here that flamenco is a colonial or bourgeois appropriation and bastardization of pre-colonial (indigenous, marginalized) culture. Flamenco, for Lorca, should be clearly differentiated from the spiritual profundity and historicity preserved by the gypsy poets in the form of *cante jondo*, imbued with the duende that inhabits the soul(s) of the Spanish people.⁵ However, both flamenco and *cante jondo* are forms of song that are often (though not always) performed collectively; the singer's voice, the guitar, and percussive clapping work in concert to achieve a combined effect, which emphasizes the ritualistic and communal aspect of the performance.

The relationship between *cante jondo* and duende is complicated by the fact that there are two art forms present, each with its own capacity for duende – the poetry that comprises the lyrics and the interpretation of it by the singer. Lorca seems to imply that the lyrics, which come from poetry as ancient as Andalucía itself, are intrinsically infused with duende. But the presence of the duende during the performance is contingent upon the conjuring power of the performer, his or her ability to render the

⁵ Hemingway understands this intuitively, and refers to flamenco dancers as “flamingos,” expressing his disgust with the commercialization and exploitation of Spanish tradition embodied by these performers, who have turned art into spectacle (Stanton 17). This can be compared to his contempt for the bullfighters who “give a fake emotional feeling” of danger, playing to the crowd rather than to the bull (*TSAR* 172).

nuance of emotion that transcends mere language.⁶ When a performer of *cante jondo* is “caught by the duende,” his or her voice might wail, might quaver, might sound like breaking glass. Its beauty is in the rawness (and therefore “truth”) of the emotion it conveys and in its capacity to transport the singer, not in any technical perfection. It expresses the unspeakable anguishes of the human heart – the anguish of love and of death.

Duende, then, not only requires a performer to call it forth but interlocutors to receive and interpret it, to absorb some of the impact of the tragedy. The reader of Hemingway’s prose serves a similar function, a dual role of audience and interpreter. If the reader does not *feel* the language and provide the necessary emotion, the performance (reading) will lack duende. But this does not mean that the *text* (creation of the artist who wrote it) is without duende. Moreover, the vacillation of the text between tightly constructed, understated language and what Edward Stanton calls “ecstatic prose” mirrors the control and release of emotion – the struggle with the duende – in both *cante jondo* and the bullfight. Hemingway’s ostensibly intuitive appropriation of duende in his Spanish-themed texts seems both to affirm Lorca’s claim that it is a distinctly Spanish trait and to confirm Lorca’s allowance that duende as an artistic quality is borderless, that the nature of duende resists categorization and allows for much cultural and geographic interplay. Moreover, the power of duende to resist or

⁶ This matrix can also be applied to the complex relationship between writer, reader, and text that will be discussed more fully in chapter four.

subvert closed systems suggests varied and infinite possible interpretations, making it a useful tool for expanding Hemingway scholarship.

1.2 Locating Duende within the Modernist Context

Expressions of suffering, of tragedy, can be found in every culture. Duende, then, is not a unique phenomena in the broader sense; it is simply the Spanish brand of such tragedy, containing and disseminating the “tragic sense of life” so deeply felt in Spain. It is at the core of the Spanish arts and acts as the medium between the artist and the audience, the past and the present. However, the timing of Lorca’s 1933 essay “Play and Theory of the Duende,” which elaborates on a theme begun in his 1922 address “Deep Song,” is apropos of its milieu and the larger modernist project inasmuch as it can be read as a response to the same cultural pressures acting on the rest of the western world at that time: rapidly advancing technology threatening existing ways of life, Darwinism and Nietzsche’s “death of God,” the aftermath of world war, the advent of psychoanalysis and subsequent obsession in all the arts with individual consciousness (the so-called “inward turn”). Fragmentation and uncertainty are prominent themes throughout modernist literature, and various methods are employed to express and compensate for the resultant trauma of this milieu, including alternative models of spirituality meant to compensate for the loss of central authority brought about by the increasing secularization of society. The association of duende with ritual and spirituality, seen in Lorca’s coinage “the liturgy of the bullfight,” provides one such paradigm.

Lorca's advocacy of *duende* also had political implications. As the threat of fascism loomed ever closer in the late 1920's and early 1930's, Lorca's persistent claims on *duende* as a unique and unbreachable characteristic of Spanish identity served to challenge the Fascist ideology and the uncertainty of revolutionary times. By invoking the *duende*, which is bound to Spain's gypsy heritage, he may also have been reminding his fellow countrymen of the gypsy ethos, which is also strongly associated with ethnic pride, defiance, solidarity, community, and endurance, traits which might serve them well in either resisting or adapting to political and social change and unrest.

In the years leading up to his arrest and execution in 1936, Lorca led an itinerant theater troupe that traveled between the villages of rural Spain performing traditional and classic Spanish plays. Their goal was to return Spanish culture to the people – particularly the rural population – of Spain in order to elevate patriotism, to remind them of their cultural heritage, and to more broadly disseminate cultural works which had variously become, over time, either marginalized and forgotten or elevated to the status of “high culture” and therefore not readily accessible to a wider audience. To this same end, Lorca was also actively involved, along with famed *cantaor* Manuel de Falla, in the revival of Spanish folk music – in particular, *cante jondo*.

These activities suggest that his interest in describing and invoking the folkloric *duende* figure was equally purposeful, an attempt to revitalize Spanish culture by returning to its past in much the same way that Yeats and others returned to traditional myth and folktale during the Irish Revival at roughly the same time. The modernist urge to resist modernity by revisiting classicist or folk traditions is felt in Lorca's

duende, but given a distinctly Spanish stamp. Unlike the Irish revival or allusions to Roman myth in Eliot and Joyce, the duende is tied to the unique diasporic ancestry of Spain and embodies the suffering and trauma of exile, of persecution, and of liminal identity. It is a primal scream echoing through time, the past (and present) refusing to be silenced, erupting through the body of the Spanish artist and implanting itself in the collective consciousness of the Spanish people.

1.3 Hemingway and Spain: A Review of Recent Scholarship

Much of the criticism tracing the connection between Hemingway and Spain focuses on questions of biographical influence. An important reason for rereading Hemingway's Spain-centered texts through the lens of duende is to provide an alternative way of looking at the relationship between these texts and a specific cultural context, thus moving away from the habit of reading Hemingway largely in terms of "the Hemingway myth," confusing the image of the author with that of his characters.⁷ While biographical influence is undoubtedly significant, investing too heavily in such interpretation is reductive in much the same way as searching for authorial intentionality. However, these texts remain useful points of departure for any study of how place and culture are mapped and navigated in Hemingway's work.

The cornerstones to any study of Hemingway and Spain are widely considered to be Angel Capellán's *Hemingway and the Hispanic World*, Edward Stanton's *Hemingway and Spain: a Pursuit*, Lawrence Broer's *Hemingway's Spanish Tragedy*, José Luis Castillo-Puche's *Hemingway in Spain*, and various articles by Allen Josephs

and Miriam Mandel. While all of these are useful, most of them do not pay adequate attention to primitivism and ritual, nor do they acknowledge the importance of mystery and the ineffable in Hemingway's Spanish texts, which can be accounted for by the notion of *duende*.

Written from a Hispanic perspective, Capellán's study is perhaps most useful in helping to understand Spanish culture in the way that Hemingway seems to have done, but the focus is largely biographical, tracing Hemingway's personal experiences in the Hispanic world, and how these influenced his writing and its reception there and elsewhere. Edward Stanton's recognition of Hemingway's ecstatic prose and his discussion of the interplay between this style and Hemingway's more widely recognized use of terse syntax and clipped dialogue is of utmost importance to understanding his poetics. Stanton is also the only one of these authors to recognize *duende* in Hemingway's work explicitly; my only complaint is that he does so quite briefly and does not expound this connection past *Bell*.

Publishing his book *Hemingway's Spanish Tragedy* in 1973, Lawrence Broer is perhaps among the first to recognize the importance of the tragic in Hemingway and to trace it to the Spanish influence, but he insists on prescribing this influence across the entire oeuvre and the attempt often seems forced. I would propose that the concept of *duende* offers the missing link needed to solidify Broer's argument. Written as a memoir of their time together in Spain during the last seven years of Hemingway's life, Castillo-Puche's book is a useful biographical reference; due to his personal friendship

⁷ This tendency is also noted by Thomas Strychacz in his *Hemingway's Theaters of Masculinity*, p. 2-3.

with Hemingway, Castillo-Puche is privy to first-hand knowledge of the relationship between Hemingway and Spain, but this intimacy often leads to sentimentalism and nostalgia.

In Mandel, whose expertise is *Death in the Afternoon* and Hemingway's other bullfighting texts, there is again an emphasis on biographical data: which bullfights he attended, where, and with whom; how these first-hand experiences shape his reporting and fiction; and how modernity and tradition intersect in Hemingway's accounts of the bullfight. Allen Josephs offers articles such as "Hemingway's Spanish Civil War Stories," which attempts to explain these stories in relation to Hemingway's actual experiences in the war and his journalistic dispatches, and "Toreo: the Moral Axis of *The Sun Also Rises*," which again approaches its subject from a historical and biographical stance. While this article is more useful toward understanding Hemingway's aesthetics in the Spanish texts due to its effective discussion of the spiritual dimension of the bullfight and the centrality of this ritual in the novel, the element of duende does not appear in Joseph's reading of *Sun* and its absence deprives the article of many useful connections, which I have attempted to remedy in the present study.

At the 2006 Hemingway conference in Ronda, Spain, roughly ninety of the one-hundred forty papers presented had Spanish themes, and of these thirty-two related directly to either *Sun* or *Bell*. Others focused on *Death in the Afternoon*, *Dangerous Summer*, *The Fifth Column*, the short stories, the Spanish Civil War dispatches, and Hemingway's biography itself. Still others combined readings of various texts.

Themes among the Spanish-themed papers included performance (11); liminal identity and otherness (6); primitivism and nature (6); religion and spirituality (5); and death, tragedy and suffering (4). However, very few of these overlapped. The interplay of all of these themes in Hemingway's Spain-centered texts, which is important to a thorough understanding of each, is best understood by the way they intersect in the presence of duende. Indeed, when attempting to untangle the various threads that make up the fabric of duende and weave them back through Hemingway's texts, one finds that separating these elements is problematic since they are inextricably interwoven. In this paper, I will look at each of these three elements individually, but always with an eye toward how they intersect and what these intersections have to offer by way of deeper analyses of the texts.

Rather than proposing that duende be used as an exclusive lens through which to consider Hemingway's work, I suggest that it is equally useful as a tool to enhance readings with various other critical foci. Take for example recent criticism concentrating on gender and gendered roles, such as Mark Spilka's *Hemingway's Quarrel with Androgyny*, Carl Eby's *Hemingway's Fetishism*, and Thomas Strychacz's *Theaters of Masculinity*. While these studies do not require consideration of duende to make cogent arguments, such a reading might have significantly enhanced their projects. The essentially performative nature of duende might allow for some provocative connections between gender performance, ritual and sacrifice that were not otherwise considered. Strychacz argues that viewing Hemingway (the man) and his protagonists in terms of "theaters of masculinity" sheds new light on the concepts of the

Hemingway code and the code hero; and the same can be said of Hemingway's theaters of suffering, revealed by considering his work in terms of its *duende*. Additionally, the trope of androgyny in *cante jondo* – and more broadly, in Dionysian artistic and ritualistic expression – undermines misogyny and might thereby provide a rebuttal to feminist criticism that often continues to condemn Hemingway's textual treatment of women.

Despite the considerable attention given to Hemingway and Spain in literary criticism over the course of the last eighty years, surprisingly little has been written that investigates the expression of *duende* in Hemingway's literary output. Although Hemingway and Lorca were contemporaries who shared an aesthetic sensibility (*duende*), the correlation between the two writers has not been elaborated upon in any detail in recent scholarship.

1.4 Theory, Hemingway, Duende

As a site (and perhaps cause) of struggle, *duende* appears at the border between life and death, truth and falsity, theater and spectacle. This is not to say that it is related to all border spaces, but only to those that meet the particular conditions that invoke *duende* – profound emotional struggle, presence or possibility of death, artistic exigency. While *duende* does not always manifest under these conditions, Lorca would argue that it is present in an unexpressed, latent form. I will compare this to the position of Hemingway and his protagonists as both insiders and outsiders in Spain – an ambiguous position that challenges such binaries and generates creative tension.

Further, I will argue that expatriation creates a state of liminality similar to that of the postcolonial subject (though I recognize that the essential difference is one of agency). The duende, as emblematic of Spanish primitivism and mythology, also moved Hemingway's work into a liminal space between modern and postmodern, evidenced by comparing the two novels set in Spain, *The Sun Also Rises* and *For Whom the Bell Tolls*. His first novel, *The Sun Also Rises*, is concerned with the individual, inner experience, and self-discovery. Its cynical conclusion fits John Barth's characterization of the modern novel as "the literature of exhaustion." In *For Whom the Bell Tolls*, we initially see a similar pattern, but this is undercut by the collectivity of the guerilla group; the community, history, and mythology it represents; and the fact that the protagonist does not change as a result of a self-conscious inner quest, but by his association with other individuals and the group dynamic. This focus on community and collective experience is an obvious departure for Hemingway, one that is closely aligned with his experience of the duende.

Hemingway's treatment of both racial and gendered Others in the Spanish texts, which consistently challenges and undercuts such dichotomies, is also consistent with the subversive and ambiguous nature of the duende. I will examine such examples as the supposedly anti-Semitic treatment of Robert Cohn in *The Sun Also Rises* to elaborate on this idea. Recent criticism has successfully debunked the notion that Hemingway is categorically misogynistic and that his female characters lack development. The way femininity and masculinity are performed and are often androgynized or fetishized in Hemingway's fiction further points to the instability of

gender dichotomy, providing another site of tension with which both the writer and reader must grapple. Questions of Othering thus present further challenges to cultural binaries which, when read against the notion of duende, suggest the inefficacy of closed systems in the production of emotional resonance and artistic truth.

In this project, I will use Lorca's theory of duende in conjunction with close readings of Hemingway's texts to demonstrate how Hemingway's style compares to the formulas of the Andalusian poets who composed deep song, and how Hemingway uses the bullfight as an analogy for emotionally resonant literary production. In addition to my discussion of liminality, readings of Hemingway's use of the primitive and the performative will largely shape my argument, both to align Hemingway's work with duende (which is performative by nature) and to tease out manifestations of duende and their significance in the texts. The types of performance under scrutiny range from explicit performances, such as the ritual of the bullfight and the dramatic form of *The Fifth Column*, to implicit or encoded performances, such as gender performance, performances of national identity, social performance, and authorial performance .

While Hemingway declares explicitly that his narrative intent is to represent the truth, the modernist project considers objective truth a fallacy. The subjective, heterogeneous nature of truth complicates the idea of truth-telling, authorial intention, and interpretive certainty. Further, Derrida asserts that the constative function of language cannot be separated from the performative, the *act* of narrative, including the rhetorical choices necessitated by the act of telling and the navigation and manipulation of conventional narrative and linguistic structures. The "struggle with the duende,"

which can be the struggle between the life-impulse and death-impulse, between the body and spirit, between instinct and intellect, is demonstrated artistically and ritually in the bullfight and in deep song, as well as in Hemingway's texts. The textual tension described by deconstructionists such as Derrida and de Man, created by the inseparability of the constative and performative in narrative, is analogous both to the tension between the binary systems mentioned previously and to the "struggle" in other incarnations of duende (bullfight, *cante jondo*), thus allowing for the specific connection between Hemingway's Spanish texts and duende. This is a clear departure from the more general Spanish connections that have previously been made by critics. Locating duende within its cultural context, as well as within the larger modernist context, reveals potentially new insights into the work Hemingway produced about Spain.

CHAPTER 2

HEMINGWAY AND THE “IN-BETWEEN”

2.1 Liminality, Marginality, and the “Unhomely”

The position of the Iberian peninsula relative to the rest of Western Europe has somewhat isolated it from the continent; traditionally, it has occupied a space, both culturally and geographically, in between Africa and Europe, often more closely associated with the former than the latter. Indeed, for over 700 years (711-1492), the southern part of Spain known as Andalusía was, at least partially, under Moorish rule. This region claims a complex ethnic heritage, comprised of elements as diverse as Roman, Jewish, Moorish (Afro-Islamic) and gypsy (Indic and Egyptian). While *duende* and *flamenca* (the gypsy arts, including *cante jondo*, flamenco, and the bullfight) are largely associated with the gypsy influence, their modern incarnations are the result of much cultural blending and cannot rightfully be attributed solely to any one of the many ethnic groups that have contributed to them. Likewise, the dissemination of gypsy culture throughout Spain makes the recognizable separation of the two impossible.⁸

⁸ In his introduction to Bertha Quintana's *¡Que Gitano!*, anthropologist Walter Starkie paraphrases Spanish novelist Ramón Pérez de Ayala thus: “Spain is the only country whose inhabitants have merged so harmoniously with the Romany race that Gypsy and Spanish tradition coincide with one another” (Quintanta ix).

The Spanish can be viewed as a marginal people inasmuch as they are neither truly European nor truly African; they are a race evolved from the blending of these two very different and distinct continents. As a heterogeneous and regionalized nation, the notion of a single Spanish character is certainly an oversimplification. But the gypsy culture has infiltrated most of these regions and strongly colored Spanish history and art. Gypsy identity can also be regarded as marginalized, given the persecution of the gypsies in Spain and throughout Europe over the last several hundred years.

At the beginning of their infiltration of Europe in the 15th century, gypsies posed as exiled nobility, a conceit born of gypsy ethnocentrism, which often borders on arrogance. As such, they were initially treated with esteem. However, they were despised all the more for this deception once it was discovered. In 1499, Ferdinand and Isabel were the first to issue laws intended to prevent gypsies from “wandering” and from practicing their traditional trades, and threatening exile as punishment for non-compliance. Although many gypsies were subsequently arrested for various offenses, none of the increasingly strict laws passed over three centuries was ultimately enforceable (Quintana 20).⁹ While this only reinforced the gypsy sense of ethnic superiority and the proclivity of gypsies to outwit the *payo* (non-gypsy), such persecution – exacerbated by the attendant slanders and negative public image heaped on them by the non-gypsy population – fueled their characteristic preoccupation with

⁹ Quintana also notes that “during the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries practically every crime in Spain was being laid at Gypsy feet” (20). This contributed largely to the gypsy feeling of persecution.

death and suffering and their ability to “recognize and understand [the] paradox of joy and sadness” (Quintana 21, 23).¹⁰

The confluence of diverse culture in *cante jondo* and in Hemingway’s texts (as well as in the bullring, in a less obvious way) creates the condition of what Homi Bhabha calls “unhomeliness,” which he locates at the boundaries where “extra-territorial and cross-cultural initiations” occur (13). In this state of “displacement, the borders between home and world become confused; and, uncannily, the private and public become part of each other, forcing upon us a vision that is as divided as it is disorienting.” The importance of the “unhomely” to *duende* is its ability to “relate the traumatic ambivalences of a personal, psychic history to the wider disjunctions of political existence” (Bhabha 15). As liminal, “unhomely” figures, the gypsy *cantaor*, bullfighter, and expatriate writer exist in the creative interstices between cultures, a space that allows improvisation, asynchronicity, and transgression. In this position, with the distinction between home and world blurred, they can enact their roles as cultural mediators and fulfill their metonymic function.

This sense of “unhomeliness” is also felt in the life and work of Hemingway, both as artist-in-exile and as expatriate. As a young man returning to America after being injured in Italy during the first World War, Hemingway’s sense of displacement prompted his return to Europe; he no longer felt a sense of belonging in his home country, but (despite many attempts) he could never fully integrate himself into a

¹⁰ While this may seem to be a generalization, it should be noted that “inherent in the behavior of Gypsies was the assumption that feelings, interests, loyalties, and sentiments were shared, both in degree and kind,

foreign culture either. The state of knowing multiple cultures but belonging wholly to none describes the condition of the expatriate and can be identified with the “unhomely.” The liminality of the expatriate is further magnified by the socially marginal position of the artist-figure. Hemingway also configures an image of the writer-as-artist as socially and culturally marginal.

In his Parisian memoir, *A Moveable Feast*, and in stories such as ‘A Clean, Well-Lighted Place,’ Hemingway heartily endorses a writerly work ethic that is decidedly apart from social and familial distraction; a writer works (or should) in solitude and allows himself the pleasure of socialization only when he has finished working. Despite his infiltration of the host culture, his affiliation with the expatriate community, and familial ties in his own country, the artist necessarily maintains a critical distance that prevents full membership in any particular group. In his Spanish-themed writing (and elsewhere) Hemingway seeks to express the same paradoxical “joy in suffering” that comes from liminality and is such an integral part of the gypsy and Spanish ethos.

2.2 The Liminal in *The Sun Also Rises*

Recurring themes of “in-betweenness” in Hemingway’s work suggest the importance of portraying ambiguity, the messiness of real experience, in achieving verisimilitude. The publication of Hemingway’s first novel *The Sun Also Rises* in 1926 marks a transitional phase for the writer, who had previously only published journalistic pieces and short stories. Known for its evocation of the aimlessness and emptiness of

the “lost generation,” it revolves around a group of expatriate Americans and Britons living in Paris, following them through the cafe circuit of Paris to the bullfights in Pamplona. The novel is narrated by Jake Barnes, a journalist whose unfortunate war wound has left him unable to consummate his love for the hard-drinking, sensual Lady Brett Ashley. Her affair with Jake’s “tennis friend”¹¹ Robert Cohn sparks tension within the group, which climaxes during their trip to Pamplona. Brett, whose fiancé Mike joins the group in Pamplona, continues to be pursued by the relentless Cohn despite her rebuffs. She eventually takes up with a young Spanish bullfighter, Pedro Romero, and the dénouement of that relationship closes the novel.

While the group of expatriates form their own, rather parasitic, subculture within Paris and remain largely isolated from true Parisian culture – for example, going to a quaint “local” bar on the one night of the week the locals concede it to the expat crowd – instances of liminality are nonetheless felt throughout the novel. For example, as the novel’s protagonist, Jake Barnes balances between insider and outsider in several senses. He narrates from a time after the events of the novel have occurred, functioning both as a character inside the narrative and a voice outside of the action of the story, transcribing events for the reader. His emasculating wound makes him, to some degree, androgynous in that he is not a sexual player in the love-games of his circle, nor is he

¹¹ That Cohn his Jake’s “tennis friend” has many interesting implications. The doubling of Jake and Cohn, discussed briefly later in this chapter, is suggested by mirror-like image of the tennis court. The town of San Sebastian is central both to Cohn’s downfall and Jake’s redemption. Its namesake is patron saint of, among many other things, racquet makers and athletes (Patron Saints Index).

sexually threatening.¹² His position as mediator and spokesperson of the infamous ennui of his generation is nicely encapsulated by Daniel Traber:

In *The Sun Also Rises*, Jake Barnes has often, and rightly, been treated as a conflicted protagonist attempting to strike a balance between pre- and post-war narratives to endure a meaningless world. In this light, he can be read as a figure of hybridity who mixes identities to avoid claiming allegiance to any one totalizing narrative. (167)

Jake's cultural in-betweenness is exhibited both in France and Spain, though it is perhaps more noticeable in Spain. In Paris, Jake is a rather anonymous member of a large group of expats, most of whom speak French (though with the air of novelty one might expect of tourists) but none of whom have more than the pretension of living a typically Parisian life. Jake is part of the group in the sense that he fraternizes with them frequently, but he emphasizes his separateness from them repeatedly. In one instance, he describes the efficacy of saying he has to "get off some cables" (19) if he wants an excuse to leave a conversation, and in another he explains to the hostess at a restaurant that he doesn't frequent the place anymore because there are "too many compatriots" (82). The strongest sense of Jake's alienation from the expat crowd, though, comes from his frustration over Brett, which is ultimately sexual in nature. In a group whose romantic and sexual exploits serve, in part, to define who they are, Jake can only remain a marginal member. The sense of tragedy in the novel arises out of the

¹² Brett is also an androgynous figure, with her boy's haircut, promiscuity, and often masculine demeanor. The motif of androgyny is one that pervades Hemingway's work and is also a functioning

impossible love between Brett and Jake, to be sure, but also from some indefinable, deeper sense of loneliness and despair about Jake, characterized by the scenes in which he cries to himself when he is alone at night. This textual (artistic) space in which his suffering is felt most deeply marks the emergence of the duende, the artistic truth that materializes when human suffering is expressed most poignantly.

When the expat group migrates to Spain for the festival of San Fermin and the accompanying bullfights, the sense of their cultural parasitism, group identity, and insularity begins to disintegrate.¹³ Individual egos begin to surface and conflict with the jocular mood of the group ethos. Examples of this are Mike's jealousy over Brett's affair with Cohn, Cohn's embarrassing persistence in courting Brett, Brett's "changed" personality (commented on frequently by other characters), and the introduction of Jake's friend Bill Gorton to the group. Jake undergoes a transformation as well; he remains in-between but the nature of his liminality changes.

In Spain, Jake is the leader of the group in a sense rather than a peripheral figure, and his confidence manifests itself in his ironic repartee with Bill Gorton. With his knowledge of the Spanish language, customs, and geography, he acts as linguistic and cultural interpreter for the group, explaining customs and appropriate behavior to them and apologizing for them to his Spanish friends (notably the innkeeper Montoya) when they behave inappropriately. His relationship with Montoya best defines to what

trope of deep song.

¹³ This is highly ironic and perhaps intentional on the part of the author; these three characteristics are central to gypsy identity and serve to heighten the affective quality of their art and the aspects of Spanish culture (pride, honor) that Hemingway often claims to admire. If Cohn functions as Jake's double (or

degree he is an insider – and outsider – in Spain. Montoya appreciates his *aficion*, his interest in and capacity to understand the tragedy of the bullfight. Jake explains that once he had demonstrated his *aficion*, Montoya accepted him as if they were comrades in a select and secret club: “He always smiled as though bull-fighting were a very special secret between the two of us; a rather shocking but really very deep secret that we knew about.... It would not do to expose it to people who would not understand” (136). It is because of this special camaraderie that Montoya can forgive the faults of Jake’s friends: “At once he forgave me all my friends. Without ever saying anything they were simply a little something shameful between us, like the spilling open of the horses in bull-fighting” (137).

We see the degree to which he is accepted as an insider when he is invited to Pedro Romero’s room to see him dressed before the bullfight, an important and reverential ritual of bullfighting. But Jake’s acceptance is never – can never be – unconditional. Jake acts as liaison between Romero and Brett, despite Montoya’s refusal to give Romero a message from Brett and his warning that “he ought to stay with his own people. He shouldn’t mix in that stuff” (176). In doing so, he destroys his credibility with Montoya. Presumably, Montoya has shunned Jake for not behaving like an insider, for treating Romero as a Spanish novelty who might be appropriated by the expats like the absinthe and wine they are always “calling for.” Notably, Montoya is

reverse negative), perhaps a similar instance of (reverse) doubling is occurring with the expat group and Spaniards.

not mentioned again in the narrative until after the fiesta; just before they leave the hotel, Jake and Bill have lunch and “Montoya did not come near them” (232).

The theme of liminality functions in a more subtle way throughout the text in the way it deals with the casting of identity into the dichotomy of “self” and “other.” As various identities are interrogated (racial, national, gendered), the tenuousness and artificiality of such categorizations are made apparent. While cohesive group identities are critiqued, so is the idea of the individual as an independently functioning consciousness in a sea of other independent consciousnesses. Instead, ambiguity and heterogeneity are celebrated as part of the complex makeup of an interconnected humanity. This theme is even more prevalent in Hemingway’s later novel, *For Whom the Bell Tolls*, but it is felt here in the epigraph from Ecclesiastes and when Jake Barnes says “I had that feeling of going through something that has all happened before” (70). While this does not exactly parallel the sense of group identity that defines gypsy culture, it certainly creates a similar sense of timelessness and the interconnectedness of human suffering found in deep song. The atmosphere created by deep song allows its performers and audience to connect to a deep, timeless well of humanity through a rendering of emotion that defies temporal definition.

The way the American and British expatriates in the novel negotiate the foreign space of Paris and their relationships with cultural, racial, and gendered others suggests the complexity of identity and the inescapability of the past, which influences the development of identity. At the beginning of the novel, Jake describes Parisians relative to Americans because this is his available frame of reference at that point.

Although he lives in France, he is American and the French are others. However, as the narrative becomes more complex and the characters more fully developed, this simple dichotomy is challenged. Spaniards are described not only in relation to Americans, but also to the English and to Parisians; the differences between the English and Americans are inferred from the subtle differences in how each group relates to its others; and perhaps most importantly, Jake achieves a critical distance from his own nationality, recognizes his own alterity, and begins to describe *Americans* in terms of these other nationalities. The question of national identities and the frustration of the expatriate in attempting to reconcile his or her position outside (or in between) such constructs results directly from the insider/outsider paradigm that is inherently challenged by the state of expatriation. This same challenge is offered more explicitly by the gypsies in the creation of deep song, with which they proudly and stubbornly reinforce their traditional insularity and separateness from mainstream Spanish culture while at the same time adapting to that culture by appropriating its music, language, and land (or caves). The positioning of self and other into such self-conscious and artificial categories, the novel suggests, might actually undermine such a dichotomy. Considering the nature of duende, its function as a borderline phenomenon that embraces the ambiguity of the in-between, we might then propose a spirit of duende that pervades the text through a variety of dichotomies, such as insider/outsider, past/present, attraction/repulsion, life/death, or even authentic/inauthentic.

The persistent reference to national identity as a tool for describing individuals, when they are clearly more diverse and complex than this, is mirrored by the treatment

of Robert Cohn, specifically in reference to his Jewishness. While Mike, jealous of Cohn's relationship with Brett, is plainly vindictive when making racial slurs about Cohn, Jake and his friend Bill Gorton seem to mock this othering by including similarly clichéd slurs in a much different tone, one that is highly ironic. Indeed, Daniel Traber notes that Bill's racism cannot be taken at face value precisely because of the ironic tone of much of his speech and his frequent function as comic relief (167). In this light, Bill's and even Jake's seemingly racist slurs might actually serve to suggest the ridiculousness of racial stereotyping, just as similarly light-hearted slurs about women – not to mention Brett's and Jake's androgynous aspects – might undermine gender-based othering.

The tenuousness of the self/other dichotomy can also be read metaphorically in the passage about the wounded steer at the bullfight, which closely follows the scene in which Cohn is outcast from the group by a drunk and jealous Mike: "Why don't you know when you're not wanted? You came down to San Sebastian where you weren't wanted, and followed Brett around like a bloody steer" (146). In this way, Robert is clearly aligned with the steer; but Jake's war wound, which has left him impotent, also parallels the alienation of the wounded steer. Likewise, the strength, magnetism, and virility of the bull suggest a connection with Brett.¹⁴ To go a step farther, I would suggest that the wounded steer, symbolically, identifies with the bull because its

¹⁴ In response to the gender disparity here, one might consider Brett's androgyny and certain Freudian interpretations of the bullfight which look to the "symbolic sex roles of the two principal protagonists: the *torero* and the bull. The essential femininity of the *torero*, or his feminine characteristics [grace, small

wounds prefigure the death of the bull; the steer is outcast because of its difference from the herd, but also because its spilled sacrificial blood creates common ground with the bull. Indeed, the suffering endured by both Jake and Cohn on account of their love for Brett prefigures her own sacrifice when she gives up Romero (and ultimately, Jake).

The dynamic of the relationships between these three characters, as evidenced by the extended metaphor of the bull and steer, suggests connections and complexities that transcend the simple dichotomy of self and (racial or gendered) other. Navigating this ambiguity is essential for Jake to reconcile his situation with Brett and overcome his feelings of helplessness. Both Cohn and Jake are wounded by love of Brett, but one bears his wounds nobly and one does not. Further, Cohn's embarrassing behavior in the wake of his affair with Brett demonstrates the negative potential of a requited sexual relationship with Brett. In the end, Jake seems to recognize that it might be better that they were not able to consummate their relationship, that such an act might have spoiled it irrevocably.

The important point to note here is that Jake's position of resignation at the end, following the emotional climax that results in his purgative swim in the Irati River, is quite different from the restless frustration he feels earlier. This change results just as much from the emotional interplay of the three characters as it does from personal introspection, and such interplay could not result from a simple dichotomy such as self/other, which necessarily objectifies others in a reductive and unrealistic way. The

stature], has often been noted... Still others have insisted upon the hypermasculinity of the torero, while

complexity and ambiguity of identity highlighted in the text recalls the tendency of duende to undercut polarity and emerge as a an outburst of emotion when the tension between these poles reaches a crisis of irresolvability.

2.3 A Nation Divided: Liminality in *For Whom the Bell Tolls*

In Hemingway's view, the writer has the responsibility to convey all sides of the story in order that the reader might get a fuller (and therefore truer) understanding of the characters and story; the writer must not "take sides" (*On Writing*, 23). He grappled with the difficulty of remaining apolitical for the sake of "authenticity" particularly when writing about war; his novel *For Whom the Bell Tolls* is a notable example of his attempts to represent all sides of the story equally. The novel is set primarily in the Spanish wilderness during the Spanish Civil War. Its protagonist, Robert Jordan, an American volunteer working for the loyalist cause, has been deployed by the Russian General Golz to blow up a bridge as part of a strategic offensive against the Fascists. To accomplish his mission, Jordan must travel into the mountains near the bridge to develop a strategy and wait for the attack to begin. He is assisted by Anselmo, an old Spanish man, who acts as his guide and introduces Jordan to the rest of the *guerilla* group that controls the area near the bridge. This group is led by Pablo, a brutal fighter who has "gone bad" and advocates giving up the fight, until his wife Pilar assumes command of the group. Half-gypsy, she is referred to as "brutal" by the men in the band.

noting the feminine qualities of the bull" (Douglass 9).

The only other female among them is Maria, a young girl whose cropped hair acts as a reminder of the brutality she suffered at the hands of Fascist soldiers before she was rescued by the guerillas at a previous operation they call “the train.” When she and Jordan become intimately involved, Jordan is forced to reassess his own identity and ideologies. The rest of the group is comprised of minor characters such as the foul-mouthed Agustín, the “worthless gypsy” Rafael, the serious and dutiful Fernando, and two brothers. Another band led by El Sordo operates nearby; their primary significance is in the devastating description of their defeat at the hands of the Fascists. A novel that attempts to portray both the beauty and cruelty of the Spanish landscape and people (the “idyllic” and “brutal” aspects of primitivism discussed in the next chapter), *For Whom the Bell Tolls* is widely considered Hemingway’s homage to Spain and, by some, his most accomplished work.

Like Jake Barnes, Robert Jordan, the protagonist in *For Whom the Bell Tolls*, is a liminal figure. Jordan is an American volunteer working for the Republican cause. As the novel gradually reveals, he is in a transitional phase in his identity, coming to Spain with unresolved issues from his past and much uncertainty about the future which complicate and stunt his emotional (and perhaps spiritual) growth. His mechanical, detached demeanor at the beginning of the novel contrasts sharply with the conflicted inner monologues of the middle of the text and with the peace and connection he finds at the novel’s close when acting in the interest of blind duty is replaced by the thought that “you can do nothing for yourself but perhaps you can do something for another” (466).

It is through his interaction with the other members of the guerilla band that another layer of his liminality becomes apparent. He is the only member of the band who is not Spanish, but he is far more Hispanicized than the other foreigners participating in the war, as evidenced by his fluency in the language and knowledge of Spanish geography and customs (another trait he shares with Jake Barnes). This allows him to act as a “bridge” between the various factions – Republican, Fascist, Spanish, Russian – whose points of view are considered in the narrative. Perhaps it is also this liminality which allows the Spanish characters – particularly Pilar, who is *gitana* – to identify with and accept him. “Unhomeliness” is further suggested by the gypsy Rafael, by Pilar’s half-gypsy status, and by the nature of the guerilla band itself, which is equally vulnerable to its “allies” in the Republican military as it is to the Fascist enemy, as seen when Andrés, a member of the band, is almost killed by Republican guards while attempting to get a message to General Golz.

The theme of liminal identity is again aligned with the notion that stereotypes and categorizations of the other are often reductive. Pilar is a gypsy but she is noble; as a stereotypical gypsy, Rafael acts as her foil and thereby dismantles the notion of a single, definitive gypsy character or identity. Robert ponders the Spanish character and recognizes that there are many kinds of Spaniards, suggesting the inefficacy of thinking in terms of such clichés.¹⁵ Further, the strong evocation of gypsy culture in the novel,

¹⁵ Yet he cannot avoid returning to them out of socially ingrained habit. Interestingly, Bhabha points to the paradox inherent to such stereotyping, which “vacillates between what is always ‘in place,’ already known, and something that must be anxiously repeated” (95). For this reason, he claims stereotypes –

including cave-dwelling, wine drinking, singing, bullfighting, community identity, tribal politics, and fatalism, suggests by proxy the marginality of the guerilla group, as well as its strength and resilience.

The primary action of the novel takes place during the Spanish Civil War, a time when national identity is riven and both factions are consequently rendered liminal. In two violent scenes, Hemingway epitomizes the sentiment of his epigraph, “no man is an island, entire of itself... any man’s death diminishes me, because I am involved in mankind.” In a particularly valiant last stand, the nearby guerilla band led by El Sordo is massacred. Although Jordan and the others can hear the shots and know that El Sordo and his men need help, they recognize that they are vastly outnumbered and would not stand a chance against the Fascist troops. When Anselmo sees the cavalry retreating, he does not understand at first the “poncho-wrapped bundle which flapped against the led horse’s flanks as the stirrup leathers swung” (326), but after visiting Sordo’s camp, he realizes it contained the heads of Sordo and his men. It is the beheading of the men that the surviving guerillas are most disturbed by. The heads are taken as a practical measure so that the identities of the bodies can be confirmed, but it is as if by taking the heads the cavalry has robbed the men of their individual identities.

In an equally gruesome scene, Pilar tells Jordan and Maria a story about the killing of the Fascists in Pablo’s home town, flashing back to the beginning of the war. The Fascists are corralled in the church, where they are allowed to confess to a Catholic

and, more generally, fixity – are ambiguous by nature. If this is so, Hemingway’s almost self-conscious use of stereotypes throughout his work is reinforces his thematic obsession with ambiguity.

priest before being ushered one at a time down a gauntlet of townspeople and off the edge of a cliff. During this procession, they are beaten by the townspeople, whose participation is reluctant at first but grows increasingly vicious with each killing. In the end, many of the men are drunk, and the ritual execution becomes chaotic and savage, culminating in the murder of the priest himself.

As with the beheading of Sordo's men, the most horrifying aspect of this story relates to the way individual identity is simultaneously acknowledged and disrespected. Pilar describes each of the condemned Fascists vividly, both in appearance and personality, and tells how the crowd recognizes their individual traits as well and calls them each by name. But all are treated to the same gruesome fate. Further, the savagery of their executions is not affected by their personal merits or faults, but rather by the mood of the mob.

These scenes demonstrate the tragic brutality of war by villainizing and humanizing both factions and evoking a sense of something lost that can never be regained. This trauma is exemplified by Anselmo's repeated worry about "the killing" and his desire that they all might somehow repent for it after the war is over. Having renounced the Catholic God, which the Republicans associate with the Fascist government, Jordan advises him that "it is thyself who will forgive thee for killing" (41). Anselmo agrees and resolves to "live in such a way, doing no harm to any one, that it will be forgiven" (41). What is noteworthy here, as in the other scenes, is that even in the midst of war and in the absence of God, something remains sacred. Those who have participated in violent acts retain a conscience and recognize their own part in

a common humanity; in this way, they empathize with the suffering of others, regardless of political affiliation.

* * * *

The mournful wail of the *cantaor* bemoaning the plight of the gypsies is perhaps more melodramatic than the written expressions of liminality found in Hemingway's texts, but both convey the emotion of "unhomeliness." *Cante jondo* and the bullfight have both been enhanced over time by gypsy adaptations of older Andalusian and Byzantine forms and thus become syncretic; both are therefore expressions of resistance to and defiance of a dominant culture that has persecuted and attempted to assimilate it.¹⁶ Themes of gypsy persecution in deep song and the evocation of the duende during these performances give the songs the emotion they need to have an affective impact on their audiences. Rather than an apologia for their nonconformance to societal norms or a lament for their pitiable circumstances, these art forms celebrate the refusal of the liminal figure to be absorbed or bow to pressure, as well as his or her ability to endure with dignity. This motif is readily evident in Hemingway's work, and his deep interest

¹⁶ The gypsies may have appeared to assimilate to Andalusian culture, but they have reinvented it and made it their own, infusing it with motifs relevant to gypsy tradition; in this sense, they have appropriated it. Although the interaction between Andalusian and gypsy culture appeared to be a "two-way acculturative exchange," in actuality "the Gypsy selected and integrated into his own culture only those traits... which best suited his changing needs and wants... in a manner designed both to produce the least chaos in Gypsy culture and to maintain its definite distinctness" (Quintana 25).

in the bullfight, in particular, is associated with its embodiment of a liminal hero who confronts danger and accepts his fate honorably.

CHAPTER 3

HEMINGWAY AND PRIMITIVISM

In anthropology, the word “primitive” is used to describe pre-industrial societies which have remained largely uncorrupted by external influence. These societies are characterized by communal labor and economies, group identification, reverence for nature, and complex mythologies that are reified through rituals. Further, these rituals are often associated with rites of passage such as birth, puberty, marriage, and death, as well as with magic and mysticism. There is an emphasis in primitive societies on interconnectivity and unity, both with other people and between humans and the natural world.

Particularly in the context of modernism, the primitive is defined by positioning it in binary opposition to the modern, industrialized, “civilized” world. This binary parallels the classical division between the Apollonian and Dionysian, in which Apollo signifies light and reason while Dionysus represents the primal and unconscious. As an ideology, primitivism appears in modernist art and literature as a way of critiquing modernity and civilization by privileging the primitive figure who is often attributed with greater emotional depth and a healthier attitude toward the unconscious and toward sexuality. Modernist primitivism therefore often manifests itself in images of sexuality and nature, in a “concern with dreams and symbols,” and in a “focus on rhythmic and percussive elements, especially in music and ritual performance” (Wikipedia.com).

These elements can all be found in Hemingway and are a part of his expression of primitivism.

Most of Hemingway's work – and certainly all of the Spanish-themed texts – demonstrate a marked thematic interest in what Jeffrey Meyers calls “the idyllic [and] the brutal – the two dominant characteristics of the primitive world” (307). Hemingway's desire to articulate the profound emotion he had experienced in war is well documented, as is his deep connection to nature going back to childhood. The bullfight provided him with a forum in which he might witness “violent death,” which he viewed as “one of the simplest things of all and the most fundamental” (*DIA*, 2), and therefore essential to portray accurately if he was to learn to write well. In Spain, he located a country enough removed from modernity to contain vestiges of the primitive that so fascinated him, including wide expanses of untamed wilderness and a culture deeply connected with a sense of mortality, celebrating life through rituals of death and suffering in the bullfight and *cante jondo*.

The ability to produce the purity of emotion attributed to *duende* is an integral and essential element of gypsy culture and, more specifically, the gypsified versions of the Spanish arts of the bullfight and *cante jondo*. This ability is closely aligned with the primitive due to the mythic qualities of these art forms, their position as cultural vehicles through which gypsy tradition is communicated and carried, and, in *cante jondo*, the use of primitive motifs such as ritual, wine, androgyny, and nature. While locating the primitive in Hemingway's texts is not the same as locating *duende*, since these are not the same despite their close association, Hemingway's use of the primitive

is an important element in his expression of *duende*. It is the combined effect of primitivism, ritual, the performative, and the ineffable sense of tragedy in his work that gives rise to *duende*.

The Spanish identification with the bull recalls the Mithraic cults of early Iberia, which originated in ancient Greece. It is from these cults that the mythology of the bull as a symbol of both destruction and creation arise and from whence the art of the bullfight emerges. The bullfight, according to Hemingway and virtually everyone with any knowledge of tauromachy, is essentially a tragedy rather than a sport. It is a ritualized reenactment of mythic proportions, meant to give both the matador and, through him, the audience a feeling of immortality at the expense of the bull. It is only through the death of the bull that the survival and heroism of the matador becomes significant; the tragedy of the bullfight is that the bull, who faces his demise nobly and without ever ceasing to fight, must invariably die so that the matador might “live.” This ritual aspect of the bullfight clearly demonstrates a type of primitive paganism in which the animal which must be slaughtered for the sustenance of the people is honored and revered for its sacrifice. The persistent awareness of the inevitability of death which is at the root of the fatalism that runs through gypsy tradition is also found in deep song.

The gypsy traditions of fatalism and insularity, among others, are communicated and passed down through *cante jondo*, which often contains the theme of persecution that enforces the insularity of the culture as well as its privileging of group identity over individualism. Bertha Quintana reports that, apart from seasonal celebrations and extemporaneous performances, *cante jondo* is primarily performed at ceremonies of

birth and marriage, and probably at funerals (67).¹⁷ Its ritual function to facilitate rites of passage closely aligns *cante jondo* with primitivism; this is further evidenced by the historical connection between deep song and the Dionysian rites of ancient Greece.

Much attention has been given to Hemingway's use of the primitive, especially with reference to his treatment of Native Americans and Spaniards throughout his oeuvre. I will discuss Hemingway's various uses of primitivism in his Spanish-themed texts, and further, suggest that considering these in relation to *duende* offers a way to better understand Hemingway's ambivalent attitude toward the primitive, which he at times fetishizes in a nostalgic and unrealistic way, and at other times uses as a vehicle for criticizing the tendency of the modernist artist to treat the primitive in this way. Further, by looking at the Spaniard-as-primitive motif, we can see a marked change in Hemingway's depiction of the primitive from his early, pre-contact short stories to his later post-contact fiction. This evolution problematizes any attempt to arrive at a categorical and cohesive interpretation of Hemingway's primitivism, which changes through his experience and exposure to his "primitive" subjects, with the rhetorical goals of each text, and even from character to character within a single text. The ambiguous and elusive nature of *duende* helps to account for some of this fluctuation.

¹⁷ While it seems likely that *cante jondo* would be performed at funerals given its thematic content (suffering, death), Quintana was unable to verify this in the course of her field research due to conflicting accounts, both among gypsy and non-gypsy informants. She attributes this to gypsy insularity and the resultant rarity with which outsiders are permitted to witness gypsy funerals (67).

3.1 Uses of the Primitive in *The Sun Also Rises*

In her book *Imagining the Primitive in Naturalist and Modernist Literature*, Gina Rossetti argues that Hemingway's use of the primitive in *The Sun Also Rises* is meant to critique the modernist tendency to elevate the primitive in an unrealistic way, and that his book *Torrents of Spring*, written concurrently, serves this same purpose. However, the consistency with which Hemingway both uses and praises nature and the primitive throughout his oeuvre suggest otherwise. To be sure, *Torrents* is a critique of Hemingway's contemporaries in just the way Rossetti suggests; Hemingway has stated as much himself. But *Sun* exhibits a much more dynamic use of the primitive in which such critique is balanced by seemingly sincere efforts to communicate an appreciation of the primitive.

The juxtaposition of the cold, sterile Parisian cafe scene with the lush and warm natural landscapes in Spain suggest a privileging of the primitive over the civilized – or at least, of the rural over the urban. But the poetic description of the Spanish countryside and the Burguete fishing trip are undercut by Bill's irony when he gives a mock sermon to nature: "Let us not pry into the mysteries of the hen coop with simian fingers. Let us accept on faith and simply say... and I want you to say with me, on your knees, brother. Let no man be ashamed to kneel here in the great out-of-doors. Remember the woods were God's first temples" (126). Reminiscent of the preceding scene in which Bill mocks expatriates by telling Jake how he ought to behave as an expat, this speech seems to be Bill's reminder to Jake that, while they might heartily appreciate and be rejuvenated by their idyll, he should take care not to get too

“precious” about it. These conflicting attitudes toward the primitive mirror Jake’s position in between the civilized in Paris and the primitive in Spain.

The use of nature-as-primitive is augmented by the introduction of primitive characters who transfigures the qualities of primitivism into human form, reifying an archetype against which the other characters, and modern humanity in general, might be assessed. In *The Sun Also Rises*, the primitive is suggested most readily by the Basque peasants. On the bus to Burguete, Jake and Bill engage in a wine drinking ritual with the Basques that creates a moment of what Victor Turner calls *spontaneous communitas*, briefly defined as the spontaneous eruption of goodwill, camaraderie, and mutual understanding often associated with ritual drama. This episode inculcates Jake and Bill into the primitive world of rural Spain.

Less apparently, but perhaps more importantly, the young bullfighter Pedro Romero is also a primitive figure. He is “unspoiled” by modernity – Montoya doesn’t want him to associate with Brett and says he should stay with his own kind – and, as a matador and carrier of ancient tradition, is particularly skillful at invoking *duende* in the bullring, as evidenced by Jake’s praise of Romero. Romero and Cohn make for a provocative contrast that parallels the contrast between the primitive and civilized inasmuch as they are both marginal figures, Romero as a bullfighter and Cohn as a Jew. As Daniel Traber has noted, Cohn tries to downplay his Jewish heritage and assimilate with the “mainstream standards of ‘civility’” (175). In Cohn, then, we have a character self-identified with modern “civility” who is uncomfortable with his identity and whose behavior suggests a similar uncertainty about how to negotiate the social codes of the

mainstream. Romero, on the other hand, is incorruptibly bound to his marginal identity as a bullfighter and carrier of tradition; despite Montoya's fears, the time he spends with Brett does not change this.¹⁸

Romero's grace in the bullring and dignity in social situations seem to come from the primitive cultural codes to which he is bound. The composed and dignified way with which Romero faces Cohn's attack contrasts sharply with the lack of composure shown by Cohn at several instances throughout the novel, including his attack on Romero and the "scenes" with women in which he cries publicly. The conflict between these characters, literally and figuratively, suggests the conflict between the primitive and the civilized, and the struggle between composure and emotional outpouring, as exemplified by the confrontation between Cohn and Romero, is also a central source of tension in *cante jondo* and the bullfight. It is at this junction that *duende* might emerge.

3.2 Uses of the Primitive in *For Whom the Bell Tolls*

If the primitive is associated with the natural world and privileges tradition, ritual and collectivity, *For Whom the Bell Tolls* develops these themes even more fully than *The Sun Also Rises*. This may, in part, be explained by the development of Hemingway's understanding of Spain and the Spanish primitive through prolonged

¹⁸ In his presentation at the 12th International Hemingway Conference in Ronda, Spain (2006), Jeffrey Herlihy noted that Romero is perhaps not as "unspoiled" as the aficionados would like to believe, as evidenced by the year he spent working in the British colony of Gibraltar, where he learned English and had sexual relations with at least two women. This highlights both the naïveté of the aficionados (and perhaps their tendency to mythologize the matador unrealistically) and the fact that Romero's exposure to foreigners does not ultimately have the corrupting influence they fear; he has retained his nobility and character despite this outside influence.

contact with the country over a period of time. It has been noted in Hemingway criticism that his early sketches about bullfighting, written before he ever saw a bullfight, are idealistic and largely based on the mythology of the bullfight, stereotypes, and hearsay. These are not nearly as accurate technically or emotionally as the bullfighting piece he wrote after seeing his first fight, or any subsequent descriptions of bullfighting as his knowledge of the ritual continued to develop. Similarly, there seems to be very little cultural differentiation between the Basque peasants, Montoya, and even Romero; they are all simply Spanish. In *For Whom the Bell Tolls*, however, Jordan explicitly recognizes his own folly in thinking of the Spanish in such broad terms and corrects himself with the thought that there are “good ones” and “bad ones” and that Spaniards come in many different types.

In *For Whom the Bell Tolls*, the struggle between Jordan’s love for the primitive guerillas and his duty to the modern war machine suggests a much-needed balance between these two realms. As Rod Romesburg has proposed, the characters of Pilar and Anselmo offer such balance. He outlines a spectrum on which the feminine Maria represents nature and order, and the masculine General Golz “epitomizes the chaotic isolation of a patriarchal society” (144). Vacillating between these two points, Jordan encounters Anselmo and Pilar. Interestingly, Romesburg’s assertion that these two characters complicate the order/chaos binary is contingent on their androgynous qualities. In Romesburg’s inverted paradigm, nature and order are associated with the feminine while civilization and chaos are associated with the masculine. Anselmo’s feminine (emotional) qualities and Pilar’s masculine (brutal) qualities and their ability

to “mediate and confuse archetypical gender roles” (145) make them intermediaries that are posited as more realistic (both as characters and as people) than Maria and Golz, who “offer an idealized version of disconnection and reconnection” (145).

The motif of androgyny which pervades Hemingway’s work is also a functioning trope of deep song, and the essential androgyny of the *matador* – his embodiment of feminine grace and masculine strength – also adds to the emotional appeal of the bullfight. Such androgyny challenges the simple dichotomy of male/female which is so primary to identity construction, thus serving to disrupt Western ontology. In this way, the notion of superior/inferior is also undercut. This suggests that the text does not ultimately privilege either the primitive or the civilized, the female or the male, but seeks to blend the two. The creative tension between these binaries can be equated with the struggle between the artist and his *duende*.

Mirroring her gender liminality, Pilar’s half-gypsy identity is located in the interstitial space between Spanish and Roma culture. In this role, she acts as a cultural and spiritual guide between the primitive and civilized. The wisdom she imparts to Robert Jordan in her roles as leader of the guerillas comes from both of these arenas. Pilar’s gypsy fatalism and the mysticism she possesses as a daughter of the Roma people have as much impact on Jordan as her practical, strategic advice. He values, for example, her opinion about how her husband Pablo, who has “gone bad” and turned against the cause, should be handled, and seeks her counsel about other important decisions as well. But Pilar does not limit her advice to the masculine, militaristic aspects of their interaction. She acts as chaperon in the relationship between Jordan and

Maria and advises both of them in matters of love and sex. Her association with emotional matters and her deep sense of tragedy, which are bound up in her ability to invoke duende when she tells stories, extend to the fatalistic and mystical aspects of her heritage.

Soon after their first meeting, Pilar is induced to read Jordan's palm, recoils abruptly, and refuses to tell him what she sees. Despite Jordan's repeated claims that he doesn't believe in such gypsy superstition, he also repeatedly revisits this experience and asks her to tell him what she saw. In a later instance, Maria and Jordan agree that "the earth moved" when they made love in a field of heather. Upon hearing this, Pilar says that such things are commonly known among the gypsies, but that a person can only experience this sensation three times in a life. Jordan scoffs at her "superstition," but he does not deny that the earth moved, and the question of earth-moving continues to reappear. In another example, Pilar claims that the Russian officer Kashkin, who had been involved with a previous mission to blow up a train, had the smell of impending death about him. Again, Jordan and the others scoff, but her description of what impending death smells like continues to haunt him. Indeed, when she is describing anything horrific, from the smell of death to the massacre of the Fascists, there is a deep, resonant sense of tragedy. Jordan envies her ability to recount her story so vividly and with such feeling: "God, how she could tell a story. She's better than Quevedo, he thought. He never wrote the death of any Don Faustino as well as she told it" (134). Her audience is haunted by the images of death and suffering she has conjured because

she, herself, is; in this way, she is similar to the *cantaor* or matador whose metonymic quality allows him to project his own emotion onto the audience.

The primitive is also strongly felt throughout the novel in the contrast between the natural setting of the Guadarrama mountains and the encroachment of machines such as armored cars, tanks, and airplanes. The novel associates natural bodily functions with nature and the earth, perhaps in implicit contrast with the way these activities are either deemphasized or taken for granted in the “civilized” world. Much attention is given, for example, to descriptions of eating, drinking, physical exertion, and sex. Drinking moderately with the rest of the group is acceptable and creates a sense of community, while drinking excessively in solitude, as Pablo does, is scorned. Jordan’s legs burn “in a good way” after climbing the mountainside with Anselmo, whose physical endurance Jordan admires. Copulation becomes ritualized and associated with nature; Jordan and Maria always make love outdoors, and their most profound lovemaking occurs in a meadow of heather.

The spilling of semen into the earth explicitly suggests fertility, as does Maria’s nickname, Rabbit. Maria’s connection with the earth, established imagistically throughout the novel, further suggests her fertility and the possibility that Jordan, who as a soldier is trained to take life, might also be creating life. Indeed, Rafael teases Jordan about this after Jordan and Maria’s first night together: “You were supposed to kill [a man last night], not make one!” (79). However, Maria’s confession to Jordan that she might have been damaged by her rape and thus unable to bear children casts some doubt upon her ability to reproduce. The uncertainty of her fertility serves to

further the metaphor of Maria-as-Spain; just as Maria's life and reproductive capability is uncertain, so are the survival and regeneration of Spain. The dual image of destruction and regeneration is similarly suggested by the hunting of the game that comprises their meals; the animals die to nourish their bodies, and when they themselves die, their bodies nourish the Spanish earth. The strong sense of mortality and immortality bound up in these images is consistent with the ritual of the bullfight and themes of death, fatalism, and the endurance of tradition in *cante jondo*.

Most of Hemingway's work – and certainly all of the Spanish-themed texts – demonstrate a marked thematic interest in what Jeffrey Meyers calls “the idyllic [and] the brutal – the two dominant characteristics of the primitive world” (307). Hemingway's desire to articulate the profound emotion he had experienced in war is well documented, as is his deep connection to nature going back to childhood. The bullfight provided him with a forum in which he might witness “violent death,” which he viewed as “one of the simplest things of all and the most fundamental” (*DIA*, 2), and therefore essential to portray accurately if he was to learn to write well. In Spain, he located a country enough removed from modernity to contain vestiges of the primitive that so fascinated him, including wide expanses of untamed wilderness and a culture deeply connected with a sense of mortality, celebrating life through rituals of death and suffering in the bullfight and *cante jondo*.

3.3 Hemingway's "Ecstatic Prose": Toward a Poetics of the Primitive

According to Stanley Diamond, ritual dramas in primitive societies "are cathartic in that they serve as occasions for open, if culturally molded, expressions of ambivalent feelings about sacred tradition, constituted authority, animal and human nature, and nature at large" (151). The bullfight and *cante jondo* are examples of primitive rituals that have survived the modernization of Spain and are reminders of its relatively recent primitive past. The struggle between the encoded forms that contain these rituals and the emotional and spiritual ecstasy achieved in their performance can also be found in the rhythms of Hemingway's prose and contribute to the conditions and inspiration necessary to evoke the *duende*.

In *Hemingway and Spain: a Pursuit*, Edward Stanton describes what he calls Hemingway's "ecstatic prose," remarkable in its variation from the otherwise tightly controlled, terse prose typical of the writer:

The ecstatic passages are a liberation from the rigid control of the "Hemingway style": the pressure of memory and fear have disappeared. These passages are not "dry" and static, but dynamic and "wet" with all the fecundity of life. They do not represent conscious, rational control by the writer, but a tapping of the unconscious mind and an unleashing of irrational forces. As the bullfighter and the public are united by a common emotion, the creator who writes ecstatic prose and the public who reads it are united in a feeling of release, purification,

and catharsis. For this reason Hemingway felt empty and hollow inside after a few hours of good writing, and we may feel something similar after reading his best work. (34)¹⁹

An analogous pattern underlies the structure of *cante jondo*: “The melody of deep song is rich in ornamental turns, but they are only used at certain moments, like expansions or sudden gusts brought on by the emotional strength of the poem” (Falla qtd. in Lorca, “Deep Song” 5). The prose of ecstasy has a trance-like effect similar to that of religious ecstasy or the ecstasy of primitive ritual; similarly, Lorca compares the *corrida* to the Catholic mass when he coins the phrase “liturgy of the bullfight.” Aptly, then, Stanton compares Hemingway’s writing style to the bullfight, in which tightly measured and great, sweeping movements work together to create and build the emotion of the experience for the matador and audience, thereby increasing the potential for duende to emerge.

In *The Sun Also Rises*, the marked change in tone and language that occurs when the travelers cross into Spain and the rambling, poetic rhythms of descriptions of the landscape and the fishing trip serve as examples of this ecstatic prose. Hemingway also lapses into this style in *Death in the Afternoon* when describing the feeling of the *faena* “that takes a man out of himself and makes him feel immortal” (206). Perhaps the best example occurs in *For Whom the Bell Tolls*, during the love-making scene in which

¹⁹ Hemingway has also written of a similar exhaustion after watching a bullfight, which is further evidence of how, for Hemingway, bullfighting serves as a metaphor for writing. In *Sun*, Jake Barnes also reports that he and Bill both “take [the bullfight] hard.”

“the earth moves.” This passage replicates both the motion and emotion of sexual intercourse in language, the rhythm of the prose mimicking the act itself:

For him it was a dark passage which led to nowhere, always and forever to nowhere, then again to nowhere, once again to nowhere, always and forever to nowhere, heavy on the elbows in the earth to nowhere, dark, never any end to nowhere, hung on all time always to unknowing nowhere, this time and again for always to nowhere, now not to be borne once again always and to nowhere, scaldingly, holdingly all nowhere gone and time absolutely still and they were both there, time having stopped and he felt the earth move out and away from under them. (159)

The imbrication of terse, controlled prose and ecstatic prose suggests the tension between attraction and repulsion, intimacy and distance, private and public. This tension is not merely analogous to the struggle between the artist and his duende in other art forms. The interruption of staid, static syntax with the fluid and even Dionysian rhythm of ecstatic prose creates heightened emotion and the creation of a “collective experience [in which the individual is] freed from the boundaries of his own consciousness” (Stanton 35); this same end is achieved by similar means in the bullfight and in the performance of *cante jondo*.

According to Stanton, Hemingway's achievement is neither in the cultivation of his signature style nor in his ability to replicate the rhythms of ecstasy in language, but in the way he alternated between the two styles:

To have limited his work to either of the two poles would have been artistic suicide – the result shallowness and sterility on one hand, chaos and confusion on the other. Hemingway's real stylistic innovation was the fusion of these two modes in a unique, flexible, powerful synthesis.” (35)

That these moments of poetic ecstasy occur primarily when describing the bullfight, nature and love-making suggests a deep connection between them which is closely aligned with their shared function as primitive motifs.

CHAPTER 4

HEMINGWAY AND PERFORMANCE

At its most basic, performance requires both a performer and an audience to give the action meaning; in sharing the performative experience, the performer and audience are conjoined in a specific context in which certain social and artistic conventions are implicitly acknowledged. Because performance is ephemeral, it invites variations which may be intentional or accidental, subtle or elaborate, scripted or improvised, but which must be witnessed in relation to a known paradigm to be effective. The performative nature of the bullfight and *cante jondo* creates the opportunity for spontaneity, improvisation and inimitability that Lorca insists is necessary to the invocation of *duende*.²⁰

However, as Lorca briefly notes, this does not preclude literature from producing a similar emotional resonance. If we view the bullfight and *cante jondo* more specifically as ritual performances deriving from primitive traditions, we can readily find parallels – both direct and indirect – in Hemingway’s Spanish novels. In these instances, individual identity gives way to collective experience; performer and

²⁰ Since *duende* is a form of inspiration that cannot be summoned at will, the potential for improvisation is necessary. The framework of the ritual must be flexible enough to allow for – and even anticipate – transgressions of those conventions when such inspiration announces itself.

audience relate across the medium of the scripted ritual, and both can be moved to a level of artistic ecstasy in which the inspiration of the duende is felt and expressed.

4.1 Ritual Performance

Closely aligned with the primitivism discussed in the previous chapter, ritual performance figures prominently in Hemingway's texts. As Peter Hays has noted, there is a significant connection between bullfighting and primitive hunting rituals which can also be seen in the transubstantiation ritual of the Catholic Communion. Commenting on the tendency of the Church to "syncretically assume many primitive rituals within its own," he claims that "as the primitives did with the animals they killed, we benefit from the death and we celebrate the Spirit and invite its return" (46). Similarly, the bullfight "is both a highly stylized hunt and a ritual sacrifice of an animal" (47). In return for the catharsis shared by the crowd when the matador is particularly successful at performing this sacrifice, the community traditionally rewards him with a part of the animal, normally the tail or an ear. The community shares this reward when the animal is butchered and sold at market as a delicacy; the consumption of the bull, particularly its testicles, symbolically transfers the strength and fertility of the bull to the people, thus serving a purpose similar to the Eucharist.

Like the ritual hunt and the Catholic mass, the bullfight has a set structure and involves ritual preparations, such as the bathing and dressing of the matador. These three types of ritual – hunting rites, Catholic rites, and the *corrida* – are all evident in both *The Sun Also Rises* and *For Whom the Bell Tolls*, and their presence magnifies and gives meaning to other, more personalized ritualized and performative behaviors in

those novels. The bullfight thus not only serves as “an attenuated form of religious worship” (Hays 47), but also codifies certain values and behaviors that are privileged by the narrator and acts as metaphor for the performance of socio-sexual relationships.

Because of its centrality both structurally and metaphorically, the bullfight ritual in *Sun* can also be seen as a way of drawing attention to other ritual performances in the text. For example, on their trip to Pamplona, Bill and Jake ride a bus filled with Basque peasants who instruct Bill and Jake on the proper way to drink the wine as the wineskin is passed around and shared by all, creating a collective experience.²¹ The wineskin ritual is repeated later at the San Fermin fiesta when Jake, Bill, Brett, Mike and Cohn are engulfed by a crowd of *riau-riau* dancers and ushered into a wine shop. The dancers have a collective identity, described as “one mass of yellow shirts,” and use Brett as “an image to dance around” (159), mirroring the idol worship of the celebrated saint. Inside the wine shop, Mike shares a communal meal with several men out of a single bowl, and this is followed by the wineskin ritual: “I unscrewed the nozzle of the big-wine bottle and handed it around. Every one took a drink, tipping the wineskin at arm’s length” (161), just as the Basques had instructed Jake and Bill to do. However, the purity of the collective ritual experienced on the bus is perverted in this later scene by the presence of Brett, Cohn, and Mike, whose petty differences and competing egos interrupt the sense of community achieved by the ritual. The easy camaraderie and

²¹ A further parallel can be drawn between the peasant who speaks English and has been to America and the bullfighter Romero, who learned English in Gibraltar. Both epitomize the primitive, as demonstrated by their knowledge and execution of ritual performance and their capacity to remain uncorrupted by Western (civilized) influence; both chose to return to Spain and their traditional roles.

moderation of the earlier encounter contrasts sharply with the escapist binge drinking of the expat crowd, which is driven by individual egos and executed in a haphazard and meaningless way.

An echo of hunting rituals is seen in *Sun* during the fishing trip in Burguete, which includes a description of Jake's very precise and scripted method of wrapping the fish he has caught, layering them between fern leaves in a ritualized fashion that shows respect for nature. Later, Jake returns to San Sebastian alone and swims in the river in a scene that is evocative both of Christian baptism and of rebirth; he dives deeper and deeper, and ultimately resurfaces a changed man. This is a cleansing experience for him physically, psychically, and spiritually. Along with the first wineskin ritual, these examples have a sense of holiness or reverence, suggesting that such rituals either parallel religious experience or offer alternative paradigms for the spiritual. These alternatives are especially pertinent in light of Jake's unsuccessful attempt to perform the Catholic ritual of prayer in which he tries to pray but becomes bored and distracted, expressing "regret that I was such a rotten Catholic.... I only wished I felt religious and maybe I would the next time" (103).

The ritual performances of hunting, bullfighting, and Catholicism also figure in *For Whom the Bell Tolls*, in varying degrees, and also serve to highlight other ritualized behaviors. Early in the novel, Jordan and his guide Anselmo discuss the difference between killing animals while hunting and killing men in war. Anselmo proudly tells Jordan of the pelts and other hunting trophies he had at his house before the war, and they discuss the similarity between human and bear physiology, agreeing that a

shriveled bear paw looks like a man's hand. This leads Jordan to tell Anselmo about the Native American belief that bears and men are brothers; Anselmo replies that the same is said among gypsies.²² The comparison between hunting and war is plain; hunting is both destructive and creative, in that the life that is destroyed but also nourishes the hunter who consumes it, while war is purely destructive. Anselmo's distress over killing men is repeated several times, as is his fear that he will be unable to atone for it despite his desire for purification through such a public, ritual performance.

The ritual performance of Catholicism is notable for its absence in *Bell*, and in the way its characters mourn the loss of the organized, redemptive power of religious rites. Again, Anselmo's desire for atonement serves as an example. His reversion to prayer in times of crisis, one that is echoed by the guerilla Joaquín just before he is killed by the Fascist cavalry, is another. In the absence of Catholicism, which they have renounced, they seek other ways of structuring and coping with their experiences. One such way is through interpersonal confession, as evidenced by Maria's need to cleanse herself of her trauma by telling Jordan what happened to her and by Pilar's desire to recount every detail of her own brutal story. This is similar to the way that *cante jondo* relives and thereby relieves the trauma of human pain and suffering by making it collective and public.

The killing of the Fascists in Pablo's village is, itself, a ritual performance that bitterly highlights both the corruption of Catholicism as a tool of Fascism and the

²² Peter Hays notes that in *The Old Man and the Sea*, Santiago "calls the prey his brother even while pursuing it [and] makes elaborate rituals of preparation, accompanies his hunt with prayers, and kills his

spiritual impoverishment of the Republicans who have forsaken their faith. The Fascists are marched into the public square down a processional row and the townspeople are expected to strike them,²³ taking equal part in their execution so that, as Pilar tells a fellow villager, “each man should have his share in the responsibility” (106). In this way, “the ritual of death – the sacrifice of the landlords – will bring about the regeneration of the peasant community... The peasants themselves understand that the revolution – like other rituals they have participated in (harvest fiestas, bullfights, the Catholic mass) – should bring about catharsis, a spiritual cleansing” (Buckley 55).²⁴ This killing ritual directly parallels the bullfight, in which the purpose is to achieve a cathartic release of emotion and a sense of immortality metonymically through the matador, who is an analogue in this sense of the Catholic priest.

However, perhaps because they lack the central authority of organized religion to guide them, the ritual sacrifice quickly degenerates to mob violence and chaos ensues. While the prisoners are initially permitted to confess and are given last rites by a Catholic priest prior to their executions, Pablo’s obvious contempt for the priest and the subsequent brutal murder of the priest by the mob demonstrate an anarchy that is antithetical to ordered and prescribed paradigms such as the liturgy and catechisms. In the absence of spiritual and political authority, ritualized performances create a sense of community between participants and establish boundaries which might then be

brother in order to live” (46).

²³ Robert Gadjusek compares the Pamplona square in *The Sun Also Rises* to the square in Pilar’s tale; both of these are also reminiscent of the bullring (25).

respected or transgressed. As in *cante jondo* and the bullfight, the collectivity of ritualized experience allows the participants to share in the resultant emotion, and in the catharsis of its release.

4.2 Performer, Performance, and Audience

Primitive ritual performance is often associated with rites of passage in which the subject in transition must move from an old to a new identity or way of being, but during the performance of the rite remains liminal. Victor Turner writes that, in this state, the subject is not bound by the normative structures of his or her society and is therefore able to perform acts that subvert socio-cultural norms, thereby critiquing these conventions and offering alternative paradigms (41). But the ritual context of liminal phenomena imposes other types of conventions on the subversive act; it cannot be divorced from context or it loses meaning and is therefore bound to and by certain conventions. Likewise, in *cante jondo*, the singer's success at invoking the duende relies largely on improvisations which depart from the rhythm and lyrics and make each performance unique, yet there is the basic structure of the song underlying the performer's digressions. The tension between technique and inspired artistry is central, in *cante jondo* and the bullfight, to the artist's struggle with the duende, where the tension between intellect and emotion creates the artistic truth realized by the emergence of duende.

²⁴ Gadjusek notes that many of the peasants use farming implements such as scythes and pitchforks to perform the killing, which symbolically strengthens this connection (26).

Further, the performance of deep song is not executed autonomously by the singer. Maria Cristina Assumma describes audience participation in *cante jondo* thus:

The effects on the public are made clear through behaviour encoded by tradition. This ranges from the outburst of *Olé!*, which García Lorca associates with the Arab *Allah!*, to involvement through...beating of the hands....fingers snapping,... percussion instruments, and...rhythmic beats with the feet, up to more extraordinary forms, like rending clothes and breaking bottles, glass and mirrors. (207)

By sharing in the performance, the audience helps to bear the burden of suffering felt by the performer in his or her metonymic function and shares responsibility for creating the necessary emotional heightening that calls forth the duende. In the bullring, similarly encoded behaviors on the part of the audience mirror the structure of the bullfight itself. In order to achieve a true sense of tragedy, the matador must exercise his skill within a prescribed structure, but with an artistry of movement that responds to the unique temperaments of each bull and each audience. Assumma points to the interactive way “the receivers of the rite share the knowledge of its specific musical language [allowing] them to carry out a role of incitement, which is fundamental for the release of the duende in the performer” (221).²⁵

The relationship between performer and audience in the bullfight and *cante jondo* can be compared to the way the reader is implicated in the making of Hemingway’s texts. While *cante jondo* invests heavily in symbolism, Hemingway

categorically denies the use of symbolism in his writing, claiming “there is no symbolism [*sic*]. The sea is the sea.... The sharks are all sharks no better and no worse.... What goes beyond is what you see beyond when you know” (*On Writing*, 4). Whether or not we choose to disregard his assertion and interpret such images symbolically, his comment is useful because it speaks to the readers’ role in making the text, the performative act of reading. It underlines the notion that the reader shares responsibility for the making of meaning and emotional comprehension, and that “only through an indirect, implicit appeal to the emotions shared by all mankind could one hope to communicate the incommunicable” (Giger 71).

The way in which Hemingway consciously implicates his readers in the making of the text, in his famous “iceberg theory” and elsewhere, suggests a performative relationship between Hemingway, his texts, and his readers. While the notion that the reader has a role in the making of the text is taken for granted in contemporary criticism and assumed of any text, Hemingway’s insistence on the codependence of author, text, and reader is surprising for his time and exemplifies the notion of the bullfight as metaphor for writing. The prevalence of self-conscious digressions on the craft of writing in *Death in the Afternoon*, his non-fictional treatise on bullfighting, suggests this association, which is made even more explicit in *The Dangerous Summer*.²⁶ His

²⁵ Again, the language here (“rite”) signals the parallel between the cultural ritual of deep song and the spiritual rituals of organized religion. This is also seen etymologically in the cognates *cantaor* [flamenco singer], *cantor* [singer who leads church and synagogue services], and *incantation*.

²⁶ In his thorough study of *Hemingway and the Hispanic World*, Angel Capellán discusses the “parallel theories” of writing and bullfighting in Hemingway, claiming that in *Death* “one gets the impression of following a treatise on literary criticism” (150). The connection becomes even more pronounced, according to Capellán, in *Summer*, when “what had been mostly implicit in *Death* and in his fictional

attempts to programmatically ritualize the writing process in *A Moveable Feast* and elsewhere are emphasized by this connection between bullfighting and writing. As a writer-performer, Hemingway's uses and departures from convention are part of his artistry, but he relies on his audience to "complete the pass,"²⁷ so to speak, to fill in the gaps necessitated by the inadequacy of language to express true emotional depth. The emergence of *duende*, then, occurs only through the intricate and tenuous partnership between these three contingents – performer, performance, and audience.

4.3 Performative Spaces and Socio-Cultural Performance

The attention to watching and seeing in Hemingway's Spanish-themed novels highlights the performative nature of social conventions, as well as the various ways these conventions may be transgressed and the consequences of such transgression. This is accomplished through the staging of performance spaces or arenas of action in which ritualized social behaviors are enacted. These arenas are mirrored and magnified by ritual performance spaces such as the bullring and the church, suggesting a comparison between the performative acts that take place in these various spaces.

In *The Sun Also Rises*, the life-or-death ritual drama that takes place in the bullring undercuts the petty social dramas enacted in the Parisian cafés, which serve as stages on which the expatriates perform their public personae for one another. A darkly humorous example of this happens when Robert Cohn's girlfriend Frances quite

works is now openly proclaimed by him in a conversation with [bullfighter Antonio] Ordóñez where they use writing terminology to refer to bullfighting and vice versa" (151).

deliberately takes Jake aside to confide in him about her problems with Robert, knowing that Robert is watching them. When they return to Robert's table, she viciously attacks Robert verbally, as if her conspiratorial chat with Jake has created a bond through which they can share in the purgation she attempts to achieve in her attack. As Jake notes, "it was very satisfactory to her to have an *audience* for this" (56, emphasis added).

Jake, the bullfighting *aficionado*, walks away, refusing to witness the spectacle and thus be complicit in its performance. This attitude is repeated later in his condemnation of bullfighters who "give a fake emotional feeling" (172) by reducing the ritual to mere spectacle in which the *torero* appears to be in danger but is actually safe. The scene between Frances and Cohn prefigures Mike's verbal attack on Cohn, which directly follows the scene at the bullfight in which the wounded steer is cast out of the herd. Emasculating him in front of Jake, Frances sets Cohn up for the comparison Mike later makes between Cohn and the wounded steer. The juxtaposition here between the serious and deadly ritual drama of the bullfight and the frivolous social drama of the expatriates invites a comparison that reveals the emotional and spiritual depth of one and shallowness of the other.

The *bal musette* similarly serves as a stage on which sex roles are enacted and transgressed. Jake is disgusted by the group of homosexuals who openly mock gender roles by taking turns dancing with the *poule* Georgette. Jake and the policeman at the

²⁷ In bullfighting, the *torero* performs a series of passes [*pases*] with the cape. The artistry of these passes is partly determined by the level of danger to which they expose the bullfighter, which in turn heightens

door exchange knowing glances, making them complicit as watchers and judges of this spectacle. Yet Jake is acting no less performatively when he solicits Georgette's company in the first place, knowing that his wound prevents him from acting as one would expect a man to act with a prostitute; he takes her to a public rather than a private place. His interaction with Georgette is transgressive in that he fails to perform the sexual act that defines prostitution, but it is normative in the way he attempts to maintain the outward appearance of masculinity by asking Georgette to be his escort. Likewise, the homosexuals are enacting normative masculinity by dancing with the girl, but their behavior is transgressive because of how their sexual orientation and Georgette's profession destabilize sexual conventions. This is reminiscent of the subversion of norms, ironically bound by the conventions of ritual liminality, that may be executed by the liminal figure, as discussed earlier.

In *For Whom the Bell Tolls*, ritual performance does not serve to undercut or parody social performance as it does in *The Sun Also Rises*. Rather, the various social performances can be read as compensatory acts which seek to replace or mimic rituals lost in the chaos of war. Accordingly, a much more complex network of performance spaces is found in *For Whom the Bell Tolls*, with the cave at the center. Functioning both as domestic and performative space, the cave mimics the theatrical stage with its three walls and curtained proscenium.²⁸ It is within the cave that many of the text's social performances are enacted, including Robert Jordan's courtship of Maria which is

the feeling of integration and immortality that passes between the bullfighter and audience.

watched closely by the other members of the guerilla band and directed by Pilar.²⁹ In this sense, the cave constitutes a domestic space; it replaces the home. In it, Pilar acts as Maria's mother in the courtship ritual, chaperoning the couple and giving Maria private lessons about marriage and sex. It is as if by simulating a normative family life, they hope to recreate the sense of security and community lost when their own families were killed in or dispersed by the war.

The cave is the stage of another pivotal scene early in the novel, in which the guerillas show their lack of faith in Pablo by pledging their loyalty to Pilar, effectively emasculating Pablo and refuting his authority. The voting that takes place among the guerillas to determine Pilar's ascendancy to leadership demonstrates a yearning for the ordered conventions of democratic governance and heightens the anarchic reality of civil war. This coup is precipitated by a tense confrontation between Jordan and Pablo fraught with a marked air of expectancy during which everyone watches to see how Jordan will handle Pablo. In the absence of political authority, the cave becomes courtroom and, possibly, execution platform; it is left to Jordan to pass sentence on Pablo, and the guerillas are the witnesses and jury. While they all recognize that this moment is decisive, their judgments of Jordan's performance vary widely, suggesting that at moments of crisis there are no definitive, encoded behaviors. The uncertainty of

²⁸ It also evokes Plato's "allegory of the cave," which complicates the distinction between appearance and reality.

²⁹ The vicarious pleasure Pilar gets from her role as audience to their love affair is not dissimilar to that of Jake when he acts as liaison between Brett and Romero. Pilar and Jake also acknowledge their jealousy over the sexual encounters they have facilitated.

such moments creates palpable tension that heightens the emotional effect of the performers actions.³⁰

The interconnectedness of humanity is emphasized by the implication of individuals into communities in which behavior is scripted by established conventions, and the successful performance of these behaviors is contingent upon the witnessing of them by others who are complicit in the making of and adherence to such conventions. The interactivity of social performance is mirrored by the participative function of the audience in *cante jondo* and the bullfight and is requisite to the creation of collective experience in which the performer and audience escape their individuality and relate emotionally to each other as members of a common humanity. It is only under these conditions that the evocation of *duende* can be realized and acknowledged by all interlocutors.

Moreover, the stage-like characteristics of the dominant spaces in both novels, which are enclosed or defined but still public and inclusive, signal the performative nature of the action that occurs within them. It is in these spaces, and during these moments of heightened performance, that the spontaneity associated with *duende* can occur. As in ritual performance, the spaces and circumstances of these social performances evoke certain expected behaviors based on encoded conventions, but tension is created in moments of uncertainty when the characters might transgress these

³⁰ A connection between the adrenaline rush experienced at life-or-death moments and during sexual excitement is made imagistically. During his confrontation with Pablo, Jordan keeps adjusting his pistol to get it in position as the tension in the cave builds. Later that same night, lying in his sleeping robe, he

conventions and act spontaneously. This uncertainty, in turn, produces an emotional response that is shared both by the other characters witnessing the action and by the audience of readers.

* * * *

The most obvious divergences of Hemingway's style and use of tropes from the conventions of deep song are necessitated by the translation of duende from one type of performative genre to another, since performance figures quite literally in *cante jondo* and more figuratively in textual narrative. For example, the use of nature imagery in deep song is more of a backdrop to the explicit expression of emotion. While there is an emphasis in *cante jondo* on expressing "the finest degrees of Sorrow and Pain, in the service of the purest, the most exact expression... condens[ing] all the highest emotional moments in human life into a three- or four-line stanza" (Lorca, "Deep Song" 11), the form does not deal in subtext. Rather, it is blatantly expressive, as evidenced by such lyrics as "the moon has a halo; / my love has died" or "the wind cried / to see how big the wounds were / in my heart" ("Deep Song" 11 and 16).

In Hemingway, on the other hand, nature and the primitive are used evocatively and contribute significantly to the production of emotion, which remains implied and understated. Jake does not bemoan his frustrated love for Brett or overcome the trauma of his wound by verbally ritualizing it, as in deep song, but achieves emotional rightness by integrating himself with nature when he returns to San Sebastian for his solitary

again must adjust his pistol to get comfortable and to make room for Maria when she joins him. The pistol reference is hardly an oblique metaphor here.

swim in the river. The guerillas in *Bell* do not openly mourn the loss of their religion but enact primitive forms of ritual that mimic the rituals they have lost, compensating emotionally for this loss and salving the wounds of uncertainty and horror it has inflicted on them. The constraints of form and convention largely account for these variations between the genres of lyrical song and narrative prose, but the ultimate effect of each art form is the creation of emotion shared by both the artist and audience which ultimately transcends such conventions altogether. The collaboration of the artist and audience and the sense of unity achieved in collective performance in Hemingway provide the necessary conditions for duende to arise, just as they do in deep song, the *corrida*, and other forms of ritual performance.

CHAPTER 5

CONCLUSION

Although Hemingway scholarship is replete with analyses of his Spanish-themed texts and his literary relationship with Spain, little has been done to connect these texts with Lorca's concept of *duende*. Recognizing and utilizing this connection is important to furthering the study of Hemingway's Spanish texts and provides a crucial link between the elements of liminality, primitivism, and ritual performance which have been studied separately in varying degrees and contexts. Further, by locating *duende* within the modernist context, we have a new way at looking at Hemingway's place in the modernist canon.

In his introduction to Lorca's *In Search of Duende*, Christopher Maurer writes: "At least four elements can be isolated in his vision of *duende*: irrationality, earthiness, a heightened awareness of death, and a dash of the diabolical. The *duende* is a demonic earth spirit who helps the artist see the limitations of intelligence, reminding him [of his own mortality]" (ix). If the function of the matador is to remind the audience of their mortality by giving them a fleeting sense of immortality through the matador's triumph over death, the same can be said of Hemingway's protagonists. We find in Robert Jordan, for example, a reminder of the brevity of life and the need to live it fully in the limited time we have when he recognizes that he is "now fully integrated" and reflects on how he has lived a complete life in the space of three days. Jordan's struggle

between the rational and emotional also reminds us of the “limitations of intelligence” of which Maurer speaks.

In this paper, I suggest that the characteristics Maurer mentions are various aspects of the primitivism which underlies the notion of duende. However, I further propose the symbiotic relationship between primitivism, liminality, and the performative as the signature condition under which duende might emerge. But even if all the necessary conditions are met, there is no guarantee that the artist will find his duende; a final, ineffable element is necessary to provoke this creative inspiration and achieve the greatest artistic truth. That duende must ultimately remain indefinable, a mysterious force that “cannot be pinned down or rationalized away” (Hirsch 10) is part of its power; this ability to defy categorization and to subvert closed systems is part of its magic, and also makes it a flexible tool for textual analyses. It suggests that no matter how definitive an analysis might seem, there will always be some aspect that cannot be accounted for, some paradox or mystery that must remain unresolved.

In his discussion of the “passion performative,” J. Hillis Miller recounts Derrida’s notion of the “unfathomable secret” in literature that arouses our passion, which he equates to “a similar secret [that] impassions the religious person when he or she prays to God” (160). We can find allusions to mystery and secrets throughout Hemingway’s work, and indeed his famous iceberg theory is based upon the vitality and significance of what remains unsaid, or beneath the surface. Edward Stanton has remarked that “as a writer, Hemingway attempted to create a ‘mystery’ in his prose” and relates this to the way that the audience watching Antonio Ordóñez in the bullring

“realized ‘there was a mystery’ in his *toreo*” (193). By making this direct correlation, Stanton locates an essential part of each performer’s capacity for *duende*: his or her ability to access the ineffable and make it palpable.

If the performative is connected to the ineffable through Hemingway’s poetics of mystery, the iceberg theory, it is bound to the primitive and liminal through the ritualistic functions of behavior, language, and art. The bullfight and *cante jondo* both derive from ancient traditions and carry with them vestiges of the pagan past that clearly align them with ritual and the primitive. Hemingway’s Spanish-themed texts also have a decided interest in the primitive, though his uses of it vary widely, and ritual also figures noticeably in these texts, perhaps as a metaphor for writing, or the bullfight, or both. The liminality of Hemingway’s protagonists can be likened to that of the primitive figure undergoing a rite of passage, during which time he has shed his former identity but has yet to fully realize his new identity. These transitional, borderline phases are characterized by uncertainty, and it is therefore not surprising that modernist writers would turn to the primitive as a source of inspiration from whence they might derive a new way of seeing and portraying the changing world. Ritual performance serves as a way to make meaning and order amid the chaos of such uncertainty, but as we see in the case of Pilar’s tale in *Bell* and Jake’s failed attempt at prayer in *Sun*, even the formulaic behavior of ritual is subject to corruption or transgression. As a Bacchanalian, if not anarchic, quality of inspiration and expression, *duende* does not provide an alternative ordering paradigm. But by acknowledging disorder as a natural and creative force, *duende* can serve as a way to mediate the anxiety of uncertainty,

which is also an anxiety about death, making it a shared condition of a collective human experience.

By looking at Hemingway's Spanish texts through Lorca's concept of *duende*, which can be clearly viewed in terms of the larger modernist context, we can better contextualize the work within the Spanish milieu and perhaps gain a greater understanding of Hemingway's choice to set these works in Spain. Although much attention has been given to Hemingway's thematic obsession with death, *duende* allows us to see that a profound interest in death comes from an equally profound joy in living. The importance of collectivity to the experience of *duende*, which underlines the interconnectedness of humanity seen most clearly in *Bell*, calls for a reevaluation of criticism that calls Hemingway's "code hero" a solitary individual who faces his misfortunes alone. The portrayal of racial and gendered others in these texts might also be seriously reconsidered in light of *duende*, which embraces in-betweenness, androgyny, and alterity. *Duende* provides a viable alternative to reading these texts through Hemingway's own life experiences or through the Hemingway myth, as well as a useful tool for enhancing and adding insight to existing analytical models. In this way, an understanding of *duende* can expand the current scholarship on Hemingway and Spain, as well as on his use of the contingent elements of *duende* discussed here: the liminal, the primitive, and the performative. This places the critic in a much more flexible position from which to undertake study of Hemingway's literary relationship with Spain and his place within the modernist canon.

REFERENCES

- Assumma, Maria Cristina. "García Lorca and the Duende." *Performing Ecstasies: music, dance, and ritual in the Mediterranean*. Ed. Nancy Van Deusen and Luisa Del Giudice. Ottawa : Institute of Mediaeval Music, 2005. 205-215.
- Baker, Carlos. *Hemingway: The Writer as Artist, 4th ed.* Princeton: Princeton Univ. Press, 1990.
- Bhabha, Homi. *The Location of Culture*. London and New York: Routledge, 1994.
- Broer, Lawrence R. *Hemingway's Spanish Tragedy*. Birmingham, AL: University of Alabama Press, 1973.
- Buckley, Ramón. "Revolution in Ronda: the Facts in Hemingway's *For Whom the Bell Tolls*." *The Hemingway Review* 17.1 (Fall 1997): 49-57.
- "cantaor." *The Concise Oxford Spanish Dictionary*. Ed. Nicholas Rollin. Oxford University Press, 1998. *Oxford Reference Online*. Oxford University Press. University of Texas - Arlington. 21 July 2006.
<<http://continuum.uta.edu:2408/views/ENTRY.html?subview=Main&entry=t67a.e5235>>
- "cantor." *The Concise Oxford English Dictionary*. Ed. Catherine Soanes and Angus Stevenson. Oxford University Press, 2004. *Oxford Reference Online*. Oxford University Press. University of Texas - Arlington. 21 July 2006.
<<http://continuum.uta.edu:2408/views/ENTRY.html?subview=Main&entry=t23.e8196>>

Capellán, Angel. *Hemingway and the Hispanic World*. Ann Arbor, MI: UMI Research Press, 1985.

Culler, Jonathan. "Philosophy and Literature: The Fortunes of the Performative." *Poetics Today* 21.3 (Fall 2000): 503-519.

Douglass, Carrie B. *Bulls, Bullfighting, and Spanish Identity*. Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1997.

Gadjusek, Robert. "Pilar's Tale: the Myth and the Message." *The Hemingway Review* 10.1 (Fall 1990): 19-33.

Giger, Romeo. *The Creative Void: Hemingway's Iceberg Theory*. Zurich: Francke Verlag Bern, 1977.

Hays, Peter L. "Hunting Ritual in *The Sun Also Rises*." *The Hemingway Review* 8.2 (Spring 1989): 46-48.

Hemingway, Ernest. *Death in the Afternoon*. New York: Scribner, 1996.

---. *Ernest Hemingway on Writing*. Ed. Larry W. Phillips. New York: Touchstone, 1984.

---. *For Whom the Bell Tolls*. New York: Scribner, 1995.

---. *The Sun Also Rises*. New York: Scribner, 1995.

Herlihy, Jeffrey. "Foreignness in *The Sun Also Rises*: 'I wanted to ask you because you were an American.'" 12th Biannual International Hemingway Conference. Palacio Congreso, Ronda, Spain. 26 July 2006.

Hirsch, Edward. *The Demon and the Angel: Searching for the Source of Artistic Inspiration*. Orlando: Harcourt Inc., 2002

- "incantation *n.*" *The Concise Oxford English Dictionary*. Ed. Catherine Soanes and Angus Stevenson. Oxford University Press, 2004. *Oxford Reference Online*. Oxford University Press. University of Texas - Arlington. 21 July 2006. <<http://continuum.uta.edu:2408/views/ENTRY.html?subview=Main&entry=t23.e27911>>
- Kinnamon, Keith. "Hemingway, the Corrida, and Spain." *The Sun Also Rises: A Casebook*. Ed. Linda Wagner-Martin. New York: Oxford University Press, 2002. 125-138.
- Lorca, Federico García. "Deep Song." *In Search of Duende*. New York: New Directions Publishing Corp., 1998.
- . "Play and Theory of Duende." *In Search of Duende*, New York: New Directions Publishing Corp., 1998.
- . "Poem of the Bull." *In Search of Duende*, New York: New Directions Publishing Corp., 1998.
- Maurer, Christopher. Introduction. *In search of Duende*. By Federico García Lorca. New York: New Directions Publishing Corp., 1998.
- Meyers, Jeffrey. "Hemingway's Primitivism and 'Indian Camp.'" *New Critical Approaches to the Short Stories of Ernest Hemingway*. Ed. Jackson B. Benson. Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 1990. 300-308.
- Miller, J. Hillis. *Speech Acts in Literature*. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2001.
- Quintana, Bertha B. and Lois Gray Floyd. *¡Que Gitano!: Gypsies of Southern Spain*. New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, 1972.

- Romesburg, Rob. "Shifting Orders: Chaos and Order in *For Whom the Bell Tolls*." *Hemingway and the Natural World*. Ed. Robert E. Fleming. Moscow, ID: University of Idaho Press, 1999.
- Rossetti, Gina M. *Imagining the Primitive in Naturalist and Modernist Literature*. Columbia: University of Missouri Press, 2006.
- "Saint Sebastian." *Patron Saints Index*. The Catholic Community Forum and Liturgical Publications of St. Louis. 14 July 2006.
<<http://www.catholic-forum.com/saints/saints03.htm>>.
- Stanton, Edward F. *Hemingway and Spain: A Pursuit*. Seattle: University of Washington Press, 1989.
- Strychacz, Thomas. *Hemingway's Theaters of Masculinity*. Baton Rouge: Louisiana State University Press, 2003.
- Traber, Daniel S. "Whiteness and the Rejected Other in *The Sun Also Rises*." *The Sun Also Rises: A Casebook*. Ed. Linda Wagner-Smith. New York: Oxford University Press, 2002.
- Turner, Victor. *From Ritual to Theater: The Human Seriousness of Play*. CITY: PAJ Publications, 1982.

BIOGRAPHICAL INFORMATION

Kristine Wilson completed a Bachelor's degree in English at the University of Texas at Arlington in 2004. While studying abroad in England last year, she presented a paper, "Dirty Laundry: Unfolding History in *The White Hotel* and *Imagining Argentina*," at a conference in Cardiff, Wales. Her second conference paper, based on her Master's thesis, was presented at the 12th Biannual International Hemingway Conference in Ronda, Spain. She has been invited to submit this paper for possible inclusion in an upcoming collection of essays about Hemingway in Spain to be published by Kent State University Press.

In addition, she has presented creative work at two conferences, and her poetry has been published in such journals as *Borderlands: Texas Poetry Review*, *Cimarron Review*, and *Cream City Review*. She will begin work on a PhD in English at the University of South Florida in August, 2006, where she plans to pursue research interests in modern and postmodern Anglophone literatures.